

MINUTES OF THE PUBLIC HEARING ON THE BUDGET AND SPECIAL BOARD MEETING OF THE TOWN BOARD OF THE TOWN OF THURMAN, NY HELD NOVEMBER 08, 2018 AT THE THURMAN TOWN HALL, 311 ATHOL, ROAD, ATHOL, NEW YORK, COMMENCING AT 6:00 PM.....

PRESENT: Mrs. Brenda Ackley, Councilwoman
Mrs. Joan Harris, Councilwoman
Mr. Douglas Needham, Councilman
Mrs. Gail Seaman, Councilwoman
Mrs. Cynthia Hyde, Supervisor

RECORDING SECRETARY: Susan E. Staples

The meeting was called to order at **6:00 pm.**

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG:

ROLL CALL:

Supervisor Hyde noted we still have the dilemma of paying off Glens Falls National Bank. So what I did was I was...Deb and I sat down with the Tentative and the Preliminary, and we tried to look and see if there was some way that we could have come up with a way to pay off the BAN and stay under the Tax Cap. Because the idea of going with the Tentative Budget.... We wouldn't be able to go with now anyway because it's way too late to override the Tax Cap, and I think most people are interested in not going over the Tax Cap. So before we actually start the Public Hearing I want to tell the Board I added an extra line, and you will see it says Revised 2019. I went through and I was able to, with some cuts and some moving around, I was able to come up with a Budget that stays under the Tax Cap, has the same tax rate as the Preliminary Budget that **Brenda, Doug and Gail** had voted on at the last meeting they were at. Same exact tax rate except that it pays off the BAN. If you look in this Budget you will see where the changes were that I made to try and come up with this idea. The things that I have changed, the revised 2019 Budget, I am not saying that this is what is going to be passed. This is just what I am proposing as a possibility to paying off the BAN, and not having to dip into our Fund Balance this year. She read the following cover letter.

The revised 2019 Budget stays under the Tax Cap. It pays the balance owed to Glens Falls National Bank and, has the same tax rate as the Preliminary 2019

Budget. These revisions were done with several things in mind, the voting record of **Ackley, Needham and Seaman.....Councilwoman Seaman** interrupted noting alright this is enough. **Supervisor Hyde** continued the absence of a rational plan to pay the \$60,000.00 balance. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted we are going through things we aren't supposed to be going through. **Councilwoman Harris** was trying to quiet **Councilwoman Seaman** noting the **Supervisor** was talking and she needed to be respectful. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted it is illegal to do anything regarding the Budget until after the Public Hearing. It is illegal to do anything she noted. **Councilwoman Harris** noted she couldn't show me in the book so I can't believe it. **Councilwoman Seaman** continued to note that it was illegal, and **Councilwoman Harris** continued to note show me in the book. **Supervisor Hyde** continued noting owed to Glens Falls National Bank on the BAN. The impropriety of raisingShe noted to **Councilwoman Seaman** that she was trying to speak. **Councilwoman Seaman** again interrupted noting do you want to work on paying this BAN. That you haven't paid. **Councilwoman Harris** told her to stop that. Why do you have to be so important. **Councilwoman Seaman** asked why does she have to degrade the Board members every time she opens her mouth? **Councilwomen Harris and Seaman** continued to talk. **Supervisor Hyde** talked over them continuing noting we need to stay under the Tax Cap, and have a plan to pay off the BAN. The inappropriate discrimination shown in the Preliminary Budget salaries, and the need to try and reduce taxes in the hope of (inaudible as **Councilwoman Seaman** continued to interrupt. **Supervisor Hyde** noted I have described these different things. She stopped talking as **Councilwoman Seaman** asked **Brenda, Brenda** would you like to look this over. Because I have brought all the stuff to be able do the defunding, the defunding of the Budget lines, and the refunding of what we needed to so we can pay off this BAN. Because she obviously can't figure this out so we can go through (inaudible). **Councilwoman Harris** interrupted noting you obviously don't know what you are doing because you couldn't show me in the book. **Supervisor Hyde** noted if you look in your Budget.... **Councilwoman Seaman** noted we can't look in the Budget it is illegal to do so. **Supervisor Hyde** continued noting the first change that I would recommend, going down a little bit....**Councilwoman Harris** noted to **Councilwoman Seaman** call the cops. Will you call the cops if she is out of order. She is doing illegal real illegal stuff. Call the cops, call the cops, call the cops. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted to **Councilwoman Harris** why don't you be quiet now? **Councilwoman Seaman**

asked **Cynthia** you going to pay this \$60,000.00 or are you just going to ignore it again? **Supervisor Hyde** noted a very interesting fact. If everybody would look at this paper that I gave out. If you look at the back, in red, I have explained one of the reasons it a good idea pay the BAN through the Budget. New York State will actually pay \$22,295.83 of that payment if we raise it in taxes. She noted that New York State pays 37% of the tax levy. Therefore if the balance of the BAN is raised in taxes in 2019 budget, New York State would get to pay 37% of the balance owed. The remaining balance owed to Glens Falls National Bank is \$60,256.00 if it is paid in the Budget. So if raised in taxes New York State would pay \$22,295.83 of the balance owed, and we the taxpayers would pay \$37,960.17 of the balance owed. If we pay the balance owed Glens Falls National Bank this year out of Fund Balance New York State pays nothing. If we raise the balance of the BAN in the 2019 Budget we would retain a comfortable fund balance. If the Board could be convinced of rehiring Susan Baker in the Assessor's Office (inaudible as Councilwoman Seaman spoke over the Supervisor) the financial foundation of the Town. And the value of Susan Baker in the Town's Clerk's Office we could move... eventually we could convince them to refund these positions we would have the available fund balance. The available funds to be able to move money that is needed. So I have actually taken the Deputy Town Clerk money and the Assessor Clerk line and brought it to zero. And the reason I brought it to zero is because the Town Board is raising your taxes, in raising in taxes money to put in those two lines, and they made it very clear that they have no intention of hiring Sue Baker or paying her. So basically what they are doing is raising money, and they are not going to use if for the intended purpose. **Councilwoman Ackley** asked if she talking about money for next year, and **Councilwoman Seaman** noted now we know what it is about. **Supervisor Hyde** noted raising money and not going to use it for the intended purposes and that is not right. So I reduced those to zero. Obviously she was not paid (inaudible). You can't raise those taxes. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted now we know what it is about. It is about their jobs. That's all. **Councilwoman Harris** response was inaudible. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted no dear why go by the law. **Councilwoman Harris** noted that you (Councilwoman Seaman) have broken the law so many times this year I can't even count. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted prove it, prove it. **Councilwoman Harris** noted I can't right now. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted then it doesn't happen, it didn't happen. **Supervisor Hyde** noted and also the Preliminary Budget, because it gives three elected official raises, and doesn't

give 6 elected officials raises. So I put all the raises back at no raises in order to be fair. Everybody stays the same which is unfortunate, but in order to be fair I felt that we should do that. The other thing was people retiring from the Highway Department it was a good time to try and reduce the Tax levy for the Highway, and at least try to see if we can get away with less men. Pat is having trouble to get anyone to hire in the first place. And that way I was able to move more money into machinery. I am not saying this is what we are going to do, but this was my suggestion, and it's a much better answer than the Preliminary Budget that gives half the people raises. A Preliminary Budget that they raise taxes for positions that they don't intend to pay the people. And taking the BAN balance out of our Fund Balance, and we could be paying with taxes, and getting help paying from the state. So it is all right here.

Councilwoman Seaman noted are you ready to go line by line? **Supervisor Hyde** asked what line by line? **Councilwoman Seaman** noted to give you... To find money because you had defund all of these codes back to July. Then you have to tell me how much so that we can refund them out of the fund balance. No, no, no said **Supervisor Hyde**. **Councilwoman Seaman** continued because you don't get to choose to follow only half of a resolution. **Supervisor Hyde** stated I have provided the Board...**Councilwoman Seaman** noted OK you didn't. This is the law. **Supervisor Hyde** noted if you want to pay that BAN off today I have provided you with a way, and that is the way I have provided. Should you have another way then you'll have to figure it out. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted I already did that. **Supervisor Hyde** noted if we wanted it paid this year we take it out of Fund Balance. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted no there isn't any fund balance. Show us. I heard that it was \$300.00. Show us. **Supervisor Hyde** noted well **Gail** we just happen to have \$315,797.57 in the General Fund. **Councilwoman Seaman** said you don't. You do not. Show us. **Supervisor Hyde** said oh yes we do. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted OK the bank statements say you don't. **Supervisor Hyde** noted we just put \$144,000.00 in the bank the other day. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted that brings you to \$174,000.00 before....**Supervisor Hyde** noted no **Gail**, we have \$315,797.57 in the General Fund. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted no you don't. Show me the bank statements. Show me the Bank statements. **Supervisor Hyde** stated sorry, the Bank statements are all online. They are all online **Gail**. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted the \$144,000.00 is right here. Show it to me in the bank. **Supervisor Hyde** noted if you had a look at the...I have up to date...Up to.... **Councilwoman Seaman** said right here pointing to a bank

statement. Right here 10-31. **Supervisor Hyde** continued there is another report online that I sent to you guys yesterday. **Councilwoman Seaman** said if you sent it yesterday...**Supervisor Hyde** noted the 144,000. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted that's right there. There is your 144,000. That means we have 174,000, and that is without a bank reconciliation. **Supervisor Hyde** noted this amount was on the bank website today when I (inaudible). **Councilwoman Seaman** noted that is all Funds Cynthia not just this one. **Supervisor Hyde** stated no it is not **Gail**. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted oh Judas Priest you can (inaudible). **Supervisor Hyde** noted she knew how to read the bank software. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted well obviously you don't because there is 174,000 in there. **Supervisor Hyde** noted I'm sorry **Gail** you are not right. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted prove me wrong. **Supervisor Hyde** noted I am not going to go up there... **Councilwoman Seaman** noted show me the bank statement that says we have 300,000 and some hard thousand dollars. **Supervisor Hyde** noted we won't get that bank statement until the end of November. **Councilwoman Seaman** asked what revenues came in between October 31st. Sales tax noted **Supervisor Hyde**. **Councilwoman Seaman** said that is right there. A 144,000 plus the 30,000 that goes in from the....Let me see noted **Supervisor Hyde**. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted it is right there **Cynthia** passing the statement to her. It is right there. You put them online. That is where I pulled it from. **Supervisor Hyde** noted now wait a minute. Where here in the **debits** and credits do you see...no, no, no **Gail** as **Councilwoman Seaman** reached for the statement. She continued asking where do you see a credit of \$144,000.00? Maybe you don't understand. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted **Cynthia** give me the bank statement, and I will show you. **Supervisor Hyde** noted apparently you don't know how to read bank statements. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted oh yes dear I do. **Supervisor Hyde** stated **Mrs. Seaman, Mrs. Seaman....Councilwoman Seaman** noted look at the balance on that bank statement. **Supervisor Hyde** continued **Mrs. Seaman** that is the total of deposits and credits. Yup noted **Councilwoman Seaman**. **Supervisor Hyde** noted that is not the deposit that we made yesterday. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted like I said go up, and show me. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Mrs. Seaman** 10-31. **Mrs. Seaman** there are no credits here. The only credit here is the money that we moved from the **General** Fund into the Savings Account, and then we spent 242.... We actually spent \$242,569.51 which is what I could get out of their resolution. And even after paying the bank \$242,569.51 we still have in our bank account as of today

\$315,797.57. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted may I have the bank statement please because it...**Supervisor Hyde** interrupted noting well **Mrs. Seaman** why don't you stop in sometime soon....**Councilwoman Seaman** noted oh no, no you have shut...slammed the door on me, and told me not to. **Supervisor Hyde** continued and I'll teach you how to read bank statements **Mrs. Seaman**. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted because you don't know how to because Deb does it for you. Deb did the budget. **Supervisor Hyde** noted no **Mrs. Seaman** you obviously don't know how. And I did provide, I provided the Board yesterday with.....Yesterday with plenty of time so that they could look at it today a report that shows all the action between October 1st and yesterday. So I gave them the absolute most up to date information that I could give them, and I see that **Mrs. Seaman** is not prepared. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted **Cynthia** you didn't print anything out for the Board either. **Supervisor Hyde** stated **Mrs. Seaman** I told you you could print it out yourself. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted **Cynthia** you are required to do it for the Board. **Supervisor Hyde** noted no **Mrs. Seaman** I am not (inaudible). **Councilwoman Seaman** interrupted to note we have been buying you tons of toner so. **Supervisor Hyde** noted I am not your secretary **Mrs. Seaman**. **Councilwoman Seaman** stated yes actually you are. **Cynthia** where is this \$109,400.00 credit from. **Mrs. Seaman** noted **Supervisor Hyde**. **Councilwoman Seaman** asked what is it from dear. It just says credit. Credit memo 109,000. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Mrs. Seaman** let me see the resolution **Mrs. Seaman** it is right here **Mrs. Seaman**. **Councilwoman Seaman** said no those are Wood resolutions. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Mrs. Seaman** your resolution with **Brenda and Doug**. I am going to show you what it is. **Councilwoman Seaman** interrupted noting oh is that from the....Savings account **Mrs. Seaman** the **Supervisor** said. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted good. That is great. **Supervisor Hyde** stated your resolution asked me to take \$109,000.00 out of the Saving Account and you can't figure out that is what it is? Yes dear replied **Councilwoman Seaman**. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Mrs. Seaman** I think you need some help. You have a problem understanding (inaudible)....**Councilwoman Seaman** noted I think you need to sit down and go over this. Then go up and get us the recent bank statement. **Supervisor Hyde** continued maybe that is why you think everything is inaccurate, because you don't understand how to read it. I think that is the case **Mrs. Seaman**. **Councilwoman Ackley** made an inaudible statement to the Supervisor. **Supervisor Hyde** responded that is what I said. Pay it out of the Fund Balance. I still think you are better off raising it in taxes. Did you hear

what I said about New York State? She again explained how they pay 37% of all the taxes that go out because they own that much land. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted no they don't. **Councilwoman Harris** noted they do.

Councilwoman Seaman noted they pay what they want, and it is not required.

Supervisor Hyde noted this is the total amount. You take the total amount and you spread it out over everybody who pays taxes in the whole town, New York State, because they have so much land pays \$22,295.83 and the remaining \$37,960.17 is spread out to the rest of the taxpayers. So actually it makes more sense when it comes to the taxpayers pocket to raise it in the Budget. Especially now that I have been able to come up with a budget that doesn't raise the tax cap, and has the same tax rate as the preliminary.

Councilwoman Seaman noted **Cynthia** if you have that much extra we need to pay the Highway back the \$57,878.77 you took out of that Budget. **Supervisor Hyde** stated we did not take any Highway money.

Councilwoman Seaman noted it is right here. Read the account. **Supervisor Hyde** stated the General Fund paid the Highway payroll early in the year when he didn't have money.

Councilwoman Seaman asked **Cynthia** do you have a Town Board resolution proving that? Because you know that you cannot transfer money without a Town Board resolution. **Supervisor Hyde** noted we have another case of the you do not understand. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted yes dear I understand fully. Actually the attorney was asked this question and he said under no

circumstances...**Supervisor Hyde** noted your understanding is very poor and you need to get up to speed. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted I am going to offer up a resolution to pay the Highway back \$57,878.77. **Supervisor Hyde** noted we don't owe it **Mrs. Seaman**.

Councilwoman Seaman continued that was taken from their account on July 31st with no Board resolution and with no approval what so ever of money that was not owed. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Mrs. Seaman** we are not going to pay the Highway Department money that we don't owe them. The Highway is fine. **Councilwoman Seaman** asked do I have a second on that? **Councilman Needham** noted yes, I will second that.

Councilwoman Seaman stated good we have a second on that resolution.

Councilwoman Harris noted we don't even owe it **Doug**. **Supervisor Hyde**

noted we don't owe the Highway money **Doug**. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted we owe the Highway money it is right there. We do not owe the Highway

money repeated the **Supervisor**. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted you took it out without a Board resolution. What you put on line was totally fabricated because you didn't even have it to date. It was...As a matter of fact you gave it

to somebody to post on Thurman Happenings. And then it was shown a whole bunch of times.....**Supervisor Hyde** noted **Mrs. Seaman** you didn't even understand what (inaudible). **Councilwoman Seaman** noted yes **Cynthia** I know exactly what it is. It is a credit memo. **Supervisor Hyde** continued noting you have a great deal of trouble understanding paperwork. I think you better be careful before you make (inaudible). **Councilwoman Seaman** noted I think you better pay back the Highway Department their money because they don't have enough. And you told the Supervisor he didn't. So let's pay them back what they're owed that you removed from their budget. **Supervisor Hyde** again noted **Mrs. Seaman** we don't owe the Highway Department money, and we are not paying the Highway Department money we don't owe them. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted well we have a first and a second, and we have a motion on the floor to pay the Highway back the \$57,878.77 that was removed from their account without a Board resolution. **Councilwoman Harris** noted we don't owe it. You don't pay a bill you don't owe. Three months ago that was explained to you. Have you forgotten it. Did you forget when we explained it to you. **Councilwoman Seaman** asked why don't we have a vote to then to give the Highway back the money that was taken from their account and put it back into their account. **Councilwoman Harris** noted you do not know what you are talking about. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted well the resolution is on the floor and there is a first and a second. **Supervisor Hyde** asked where the resolution is. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted it can come from the floor. The lawyers as a matter of fact told you that. That it is legal. A resolution can come from the floor at any time. The **Town Clerk** noted only in an emergency. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted no it is not. **Supervisor Hyde** noted you cannot bring a resolution like that at the last minute. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted yes I can. Absolutely we can. The **Town Clerk** stated you are not giving any public notice. You are giving no public notice. **Supervisory Hyde** noted **Mrs. Seaman** no one has had a chance to even think about any of this...**Councilwoman Seaman** interrupted noting we have been thinking about this since July. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Mr. Needham** maybe you could explain to me where you plan on taking that money from. **Mr. Needham** where are you planning on taking that money. **Mr. Needham** I have a question for you. I am still trying to figure things out he replied. Seeing (inaudible). **Councilwoman Seaman** agreed no nobody gets anything. **Supervisor Hyde** noted so we don't owe the Highway money so there is no point in making a resolution to pay them back. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted it is Highway

money. You took it out of their account on 7-31 and put it into the Consolidated on 7-31. There was no Board resolution to do that. There was no Board resolution to lend anybody anything. Oh here sorry she noted as she showed **Councilman Needham**. She continued this the July 31st Highway. This is where it was taken, it was debited from there. And this is where she deposited from that account in to the Consolidated account. There was never a Board resolution. **Councilwoman Harris** noted that was explained a month ago. **Supervisor Hyde** noted it was explained a whole bunch of times, but they don't want to hear the explanation. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted that's the bottom line. So it is illegal to remove it without a Board resolution. Do you have any other questions? Can we vote? **Supervisor Hyde** noted we didn't move money. We were being paid back money we lent the Highway Department. **Councilwoman Harris** noted to **Councilwoman Seaman** you come from a Board that moved money back and forth without any resolutions. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted no, no dear. Prove it. Prove it. **Councilwoman Harris** stated I can. I have the audit right here. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted it doesn't show me what you are saying. It doesn't matter. **Supervisor Hyde** noted yes **Mrs. Seaman** the Town Board in 2016 had a great many due to due from which caused the Examiner some concern. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted **Cynthia** would you like to see what the Auditor does to your books (inaudible). I can't wait. **Supervisor Hyde** noted I think **Mrs. Seaman** doesn't understand because that was done so much so in the past. We have to understand maybe where she is coming from. She thinks it's OK to do (inaudible). **Councilwoman Seaman** spoke over the **Supervisor** noting we are not talking about 2016. I understand fully. So maybe we maybe we need to have a vote. **Brenda** would you like to see these bank statements where they took the money out of the Highway fund and put it in the Consolidated? **Councilwoman Ackley** noted no not right now I am trying to figure something out. **Councilwoman Seaman** stated OK. **Supervisor Hyde** noted we've got eight...**Councilwoman Seaman** interrupted noting do we need any more discussion or are we going to vote? **Supervisor Hyde** continued more minutes, and then we have to start our Public Hearing. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted we have to have a vote on this **Cynthia**. **Councilwoman Harris** noted no we don't. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted there is a motion on the floor and a second. **Supervisor Hyde** noted you did not provide, you did not provide the Board, or the Town Clerk, or the public with any such resolution ahead of time. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted don't have too. Don't have too. **Supervisor Hyde** noted we are not taking

action on a resolution that nobody has seen. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted I just told you right there. **Supervisor Hyde** noted we are not taking action. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted you do not have to right to say that. There is a motion on the floor and there is a second. **Supervisor Hyde** stated I am the Chairman we are not voting on a resolution that nobody has seen. **Councilwoman Seaman** again noted there is a motion on the floor and a second. You will take action. It has to have a vote. **Supervisor Hyde** noted well that's (inaudible) but we are not going to vote on a resolution that has seen by anybody but you. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted oh yes you can. There is the entire resolution is....**Supervisor Hyde** noted well we don't do things like that. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted oh yes you can. **Supervisor Hyde** noted we like to try and be much more transparent than that. **Councilwoman Seaman** responded oh my God. That is the pot calling the kettle black. OK let's just have this the right way. We need to have a vote.....**Supervisor Hyde** interrupted noting **Mrs. Seaman** do I need to remind you that I am the Chairman not you. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted good well act like one and have a vote. **Supervisor Hyde** noted we are not voting on resolutions now. We are not voting on resolutions now. **Councilwoman Seaman** replied yes we are. **Supervisor Hyde** noted we are not voting on resolutions we are going to start a Public Hearing. **Councilwoman Seaman** again noted we have a motion on the floor and a second. **Supervisor Hyde** noted we are not going to vote on a resolution that no other Board members have seen but you. **Councilwoman Seaman** asked what do you mean? I didn't write it. I just said it. It came up at the meeting and it is totally legal. **Councilwoman Harris** noted to her you are out of order. **Councilwoman Seaman** said no I am not. Show me where it says I can't. Show me in the book. **Supervisor Hyde** noted you are out of order **Mrs. Seaman** as usual. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted no according to the January 20, 2017 resolution that you passed. Stating that there was no Rules of Order anymore. You rescinded them all, and that is still working today because it has not been changed. So and that was resolution like I said January 20,2017. So that's the way it works. There are no rules of order. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Mrs. Seaman** you will have to forgive me if I don't (inaudible). **Councilwoman Harris** noted obviously there are no rules because you don't follow them. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted rules of order (inaudible). Now we have....**Supervisor Hyde** interrupted noting **Mrs. Seaman** your reputation for speaking the truth is so poor that I am afraid I cannot follow or believe anything that you say. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted oh **Cynthia** would you

like me to read it to you. It doesn't matter there is a resolution on the floor, and a second. **Supervisor Hyde** noted I could put no stock in what you say. **Councilwoman Seaman** again asked can we call a vote please. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Mrs. Seaman** you are not the Chairman. I don't have to be she responded. **Supervisor Hyde** again noted we are not voting on a resolution that nobody has seen or known about except for you **Mrs. Seaman**. **Councilwoman Seaman** continued to talk over the **Supervisor** calling for a vote. **Supervisor Hyde** continued to note that she was not the Chairman, and that she was out of order. **Councilwoman Seaman** tried to call the vote. Voting then asking other for their vote as the **Supervisor** told her she was not the Chairman **Mrs. Seaman**. **Supervisor Hyde** noted this is not...You don't bring surprise resolutions, and expect the Board to take action. It is terribly inappropriate. It is terribly unfair to the other Board members. Terribly unfair to the public and everybody else. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted show me where it is. **Supervisor Hyde** continued the only one it suits and satisfies is you. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted show me where it is inappropriate. **Supervisor Hyde** stated you have been a selfish Board member. You need to share your resolutions ahead of time with the rest of the Board **Mrs. Seaman** if you wish them to be entertained at a Board meeting. **Councilwoman Seaman** continued interrupting noting here we go with the personal attacks. There was a motion on the floor, and calling for a vote. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Mrs. Seaman** may I remind you for the fifth or sixth time that you are not the Chairman of the Board. We are going to start the Public Hearing in four minutes. **Councilwoman Ackley** confirmed with **Supervisor Hyde** what she wanted to do with her budget proposal. **Supervisor Hyde** acknowledged her and stated she would rather have it done this way because it makes more sense to her but there is no reason to move money around because there is plenty of Fund Balance. **Councilwoman Seaman** stated there isn't fund balance **Cynthia**. You have to defund all your lines first before you pay the rest of the BAN. You don't get to pick and choose to follow half a resolution. **Supervisor Hyde** noted sorry **Mrs. Seaman** you do not understand (inaudible as she was interrupted by Seaman). **Councilwoman Seaman** noted yes I do. You don't know what the law states. You don't even know how to do your own books. That is why the Bookkeeper is there. **Supervisor Hyde** noted appropriations are not cash. Appropriations are merely a code that you designate to pay certain bills out of. They are not cash. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted **Cynthia** yes. **Supervisor Hyde** noted I don't have a drawer for each code with a certain amount of cash,

and I can go get it. They are appropriations. They are not cash. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted **Cynthia** these codes were all were all appropriate at the time they were written. **Supervisor Hyde** stated no they were not. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted yes they were because it states the Board made the following adjustments defunding various budget lines to reflect the necessary budget adjustments that need to be made covering the expenses of paying off the BAN. The Board recognizes that the financial information given by the Town Supervisor is inaccurate. **Supervisor Hyde** interrupted **Mrs. Seaman** noting we don't need to (inaudible) resolution. That resolution fell short. Anybody if you would like to see why that resolution fell short I have all the information on line. I've got the Operating Statement. I have the resolution. I have the spread sheet up. Everything that you could possibly need to understand why that resolution doesn't make sense in a lot of areas. **Councilwoman Seaman** continued to state that there was a motion on the floor any Board member can bring a motion to the floor. **Councilwoman Harris** noted you've got to let me know beforehand. You need to bring it in and hand it to me. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted no we do not. The **Town Clerk** noted yes you do. It is a violation of Open Meeting Laws otherwise. **Supervisor Hyde** noted you are in violation of the open meeting law and you are severely nontransparent. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted that the Open Meeting Law states absolutely that any Board Member can bring a resolution at the time of the Board meeting. And that is the way it is. **Supervisor Hyde** noted well you need to give it to the Board ahead of time. No **Mrs. Seaman** they do not recommend any such thing **Mrs. Seaman**. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted they said that any board member can bring a resolution to the Board. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Mrs. Seaman** you have all year brought secret resolutions that no one else has seen, and expect everybody to take action on them. That is not fair to the public. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted I just stated that the resolution was to pay back the 57,000.....**Supervisor Hyde** noted that is an old resolution. That resolution (inaudible) is taken care of. **Councilwoman Harris** asked a question about the resolution to **Councilwoman Seaman** who responded we did. Not as far as I know. Maybe I wasn't there so I don't know. **Councilwoman Harris** noted wow, you bring it in and the other two already know about it. What did you do have a meeting? **Councilwoman Seaman** responded I don't know. You know about everything being done. Did you? **Councilwoman Harris** noted I wasn't invited to your meeting. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted I didn't know. I wasn't invited to the meeting ether. **Councilwoman Harris** noted you must have

because you three (inaudible) up in the trees and start talking about what you are going to do when you get here. **Councilwoman Seaman** responded no, that is what you guys do. You have the meeting with Mary upstairs (inaudible) so that (inaudible)...**Councilwoman Harris** noted don't bring her in. That is nasty. She is nasty. Don't be nasty. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted I am not nasty. What did I say that was nasty? **Councilwoman Harris** noted bringing up someone in the audience (the rest was inaudible as Seaman spoke over her). **Councilwoman Seaman** noted we are trying to not have this vote so we need to, we need to have a vote on the, we need to have the vote.....**Councilwoman Harris** noted you need to apologize. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Mrs. Seaman** you are not the Chairman of the Board we will not be voting on the resolution (inaudible). **Councilwoman Seaman** continued to state we need to have a vote on the....We need to have a vote on the resolution that is on the floor. The resolution is on the floor. **Councilwoman Harris** noted you should apologize to the taxpayer. **Councilwoman Seaman** responded Judas Priest. We need to have the vote on the resolution on the floor.

Supervisor Hyde knocked and noted I would like to open the **Public Hearing** on the **Preliminary Budget**. **Councilwoman Seaman** interrupted stating no **Cynthia** we cannot until you have a vote. **Supervisor Hyde** was stating that she was opening the....Who is the first person who wants to speak on the Budget she asked. **Councilwoman Seaman** continued you have to vote on the resolution on the floor. That is the law. **Supervisor Hyde** responded **Mrs. Seaman** we are having.... It is 6:30 we are now having the **Public Hearing**. **Councilwoman Seaman** spoke over her stating vote on the resolution on the floor. Vote on the resolution on the floor. **Cynthia** vote on the resolution on the floor. You have to finish. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Mrs. Seaman** we are now having the **Public Hearing**. **Mrs. Seaman** she continued I am sorry you are not the Chairperson. You are not bringing a resolution at the last minute. Mary do you have a question? **Councilwoman Seaman** continued to state vote on the resolution on the floor. **Supervisor Hyde** asked Mary do you have a question on the Preliminary Budget. Could you stand up and state your name for the town clerk. **Councilwoman Seaman** continued noting I am sorry. This is important. **Councilwoman Harris** noted someone was talking. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Mrs. Seaman** you need to be quiet **Mrs. Seaman**. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted no, no you need to vote on the resolution on the floor. **Supervisor Hyde** stated this is the public's opportunity to speak on the Budget. You need to be quiet, and give them the respect that they deserve because

this is their time to talk about the Budget. **Councilwoman Seaman** continually noted we need to vote on the resolution as the **Supervisor** spoke. **Supervisor Hyde** stated it is getting to be impossible to have a meeting. It's a Public Hearing. This is a very, very important event to be able to speak on the Budget that they are going to pay the taxes on. **Councilwoman Seaman** continued stating vote on the resolution on the floor as the **Supervisor** spoke. **Supervisor Hyde** stated **Mrs. Seaman** stop it. Stop it **Mrs. Seaman. Councilwoman Seaman** noted **just** vote for the resolution on the floor. All you have to do is vote on the resolution on the floor. **Supervisor Hyde** noted stop **Mrs. Seaman. Mrs. Seaman** you are a rude, rude woman. **Councilwoman Seaman** responded are you. Are afraid too? You are afraid too aren't you? You are afraid that you have to give the Highway back the money. You are afraid. You are afraid to have a vote on the resolution on the floor. **Supervisor Hyde** asked **Mrs. Seaman** are you afraid of what the Public....**Councilwoman Harris** had stood up to block **Councilwoman's Seaman** view of the **Supervisor. Councilwoman Seaman** stood and made a comment about **Councilwoman Harris'** blocking her before again noting **Cynthia** we just need to vote on the resolution on the floor. **Councilwoman Harris** noted that meeting is over. **Councilwoman Seaman** stated no it isn't. We have to vote for the resolution that is on the floor. Maybe somebody will table it. Vote for the resolution that is legally on the floor. You have to vote. That is required. **Supervisor Hyde** stated you have to obey rules **Mrs. Seaman. Councilwoman Seaman** noted yeah so do you. We have to vote for the resolution that is on the floor. We have a resolution on the floor, and a second. The resolution on the floor is to pay back the Highway the money that was taken from the Highway Department bank account. \$57,878.77 without Board resolution, and without any notice to the Board. You transferred funds from one account to another without asking. Or without any legal basis to do so. **Councilwoman Harris** asked if Mary could talk. **Councilwoman Seaman** responded not until we vote on the resolution on the floor. See we have to vote because that's a legal resolution that was brought to the floor. And if we do that then fine we can continue with this meeting that we should be continuing with. And it should have a Public Hearing not that it is going to take long. But we do have to vote for the resolution that is on the floor and seconded. You don't get to pick and choose. All the resolutions that are brought to the floor have to be voted on, and it was brought to the floor. So are you going to call for the vote? Or are you going to have me just talk until we do call for one. **Councilwoman Harris** made an inaudible response to her.

Councilwoman Seaman responded no not really. As long as we are having a resolution it needs to be voted on. **Councilwoman Harris** noted it is out of order. **Councilwoman Seaman** again stated no it is not out of order. Show me. Otherwise the vote needs to happen before the Public Hearing can start. Because there is a resolution on the floor and a second. **Supervisor Hyde** stated this is the most astonishing display of disrespect to the public that I have ever seen in my entire life. As she was speaking **Councilwoman Seaman** spoke over her noting yup, you got it. You are, and that is an astonishing display of disrespect for the Board. And the rules of procedure as far as bringing resolutions to the floor. A resolution is on the floor and there is a second. So stated purpose of the State of New York is that vote must take place unless agreed upon that it should be tabled. So we can do one of two things. We can vote on the resolution or we could vote to table it, but one of the two has to happen. Then it would be wonderful to be able to have the Public Hearing. So are you ready to call for a vote or what would you like to do because we have to have a vote **Cynthia**. **Councilwoman Harris** again noted it was out of order. **Councilwoman Seaman** stated it was not out of order. It is totally in order, and it is totally within the rights of a Town Board member to bring a resolution to the floor. **Councilwoman Harris** noted I have not had a chance to look at it. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted you wouldn't look at anything anyway. I handed it to you once, and you threw something in the garbage. **Councilwoman Harris** asked you know why? **Councilwoman Seaman** responded yeah, because you wouldn't look at it, and I was right. **Councilwoman Harris** asked you know why, you know why. Because you knew something and you didn't tell us. **Councilwoman Seaman** continued the resolution is on the floor, there is a second, and I would like a vote please. **Councilwoman Harris** again noted that meeting is over. **Councilwoman Seaman** again noted she wanted to call for a vote. **Supervisor Hyde** asked how much more time are you going to waste of the Public's time **Mrs. Seaman?** **Councilwoman Seaman** responded only until we call for a vote. Call for a vote and I am good, but we have to have to call for a vote because there is a motion on the floor and a second. So as soon as we get that done we can get things done. **Councilwoman Harris** asked the **Supervisor** if she wanted to go home. **Supervisor Hyde** noted (inaudible) she is a selfish woman. She can't help herself. She is a bully, and she has nothing but disrespect for everybody in this town. **Councilwoman Seaman** continued talking noting and you won't have time....Oh my goodness that is why you started the meeting absolutely

degrading the rest of the Board, but you do that every time. **Councilwoman Harris** noted it is 6:30 we are supposed to start the meeting anyway.

Supervisor Hyde noted we are now 7 minutes into what is supposed to be our Public Hearing. **Mrs. Seaman** has now wasted 7 minutes of our time out of our Public Hearing, and she doesn't seem to sound like she is about to quit either.

Councilwoman Seaman noted no, as soon as we have... There is a motion on the floor and a second. We need a vote. I guess you are afraid to have that vote **Cynthia** because you don't want to. Are you afraid **Cynthia** that you will have to pay the money back to the Highway? There was no Board resolution for you to take that money. There was no Board resolution for you to transfer funds from the Highway to the Consolidated. There is none. The fact of the matter is there is no Board resolution for you to transfer funds from the Highway Department. The lawyer stood here, and I asked him flat out is that ever legal to do and he said no. **Councilwoman Harris** noted tell them what the lawyer said on other things. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted he answered quit a few things. **Councilwoman Harris** noted he told you where to go didn't he.

Councilwoman Seaman noted no he did not. No actually it was very well done.

Councilwoman Harris noted that is what he said. You (inaudible) very well he told you where to go. I am agreeing with you. **Councilwoman Seaman** replied no not that I remember. He answered the questions even though he didn't want to. **Supervisor Hyde** asked **Mr. Needham** do you really think it is appropriate to take the time away from the public for their hearing?

Councilwoman Seaman continued speaking noting do you really think it is appropriate not to vote on this (inaudible). **Councilwoman Harris** interrupted to note that she (the Supervisor) can talk to other Board Members besides you. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted well she hasn't finished voting on resolutions on the floor. **Councilman Needham** made an inaudible response.

Councilwoman Seaman asked to do you think it is appropriate to ignore Board Members.....**Councilwoman Ackley** stated I table it. There is a meeting next week. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted is it appropriate to. I am sorry what.

Councilwoman Ackley noted I table it. We have a meeting next week.

Councilwoman Harris noted she wants to table it. **Councilwoman Seaman** asked you want to table it? **Councilwoman Ackley** said yeah. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted well, I will take a vote on tabling it if you want to discuss it next week. Would you like to table it? she asked **Councilwoman Ackley**. Would you like to table it she asked **Councilman Needham** who responded yes as he showed **Councilwoman Seaman** something. **Councilwoman Seaman** asked you

found it? Ah, resolution may be made... Oh this is good. Resolutions are motions. Before we table it we will read this. Resolutions are often confused with motions. Motions are the vehicle in which laws, ordinances, and resolutions are brought before a Town Board for action. Resolutions and motions are often used interchangeably in fulfilling the administrative functions of the Board such as approving claims for payment. For instance the Town Board may adopt a resolution calling for a payment of claims. Presented or a Board Member may simply move their approval for payment. Resolutions may be and frequently are prepared in advance, but you don't have to. Maybe. Now I make a motion to then to table the resolution until the next meeting. Is that good with you she asked **Councilman Needham** who responded yes. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted OK why don't we vote on that motion? I will. Do we have a second on that? **Supervisor Hyde** noted you keep forgetting that you are not the Chairman. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted **Doug** has seconded the motion on tabling it. All in favor Aye. **Councilwoman Ackley, Councilwoman Seaman and Councilman Needham** all stated Aye. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted we have three Ayes please make sure that that is recorded. The **Town Clerk** asked who was the third Aye? I only heard two. **Councilwoman Seaman** replied **Brenda, myself and Doug**. The **Town Clerk** asked **Brenda** if she had voted Aye. **Councilwoman Ackley** noted she had. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted **Cynthia and Joan** didn't say anything. **Supervisor Hyde** noted you don't have to take action on no action. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted so under the law that is actually considered a Aye. I think. Or a... **Supervisor Hyde** noted alright now do we have some people who have some questions for the Public Hearing now that we are 10 minutes late? Mary do you have a question on the Budget. Not a question this is your turn to tell us how you feel about the Budget. It is not really for asking us questions. It is for telling us what you feel about the Budget, and it is the Board's job to listen without interrupting.

Mary Eddy noted that she felt it was good to put the 60,000 into next years Budget. It was good that you got paid what you had because of the resolution that was passed and the money that was in each account that was the best that could be done. This 22,000 which is 37% of the state portion of any tax levy. And with 60,000 22,000 would make sense for the state to pay it instead of us out of the Budget that you have now out of the revenues that you have collected from other things. You are expending money from revenues such as the sales tax or whatever else it was in paying this down when it could be put

in next year which the bank must be OK with. That leaves 37% balance left for the Town's people. That makes sense, and if they don't pass it that way they have no idea of what the financial situation is or how finances work. And I believe that the Assessor's Office needs an Assessor Clerk. There needs to be two people in that office so that when people are coming in to the building to ask questions there is somebody. And there is somebody out in the field checking out what is going on in the community. And the percentage of drop in the equalization rate it shows that we didn't have it covered this year. They absolutely cannot cover everything to bring the equalization up to where it is. And we have been fortunate that two of them have worked together to keep it at 100% because many towns don't have equalization rates at 100%, and that means everybody has a lower tax rate and lower tax bill because it is at 100%. And if the Town Board could work together and have a like mind and not a closed mind and think about what they are doing it would be appreciated.

Mathew Seaman noted he had a couple of questions to ask. **Supervisor Hyde** told him that we are here for you to express your feelings on the Budget for next year, not to ask us questions. She noted this isn't privilege of the floor. He stated that in order for him to express his thoughts on the Budget he had to be clear on how much money was available to the town. I am curious before I get into my feelings on the Budget or at least a part of it how much money is in the Consolidated Account. How much money is in the Consolidated Fund?

Supervisor Hyde asked what does that have to do with the Budget? **Mr. Seaman** asked what did mom say? I am curious about that. **Supervisor Hyde** asked what does that have to do with next year's Budget. **Mr. Seaman** replied seriously. How much money is in Consolidated? **Supervisor Hyde** noted we are talking about the Budget. That has nothing to do with next years Budget. Talk to us on what your feeling are on the Budget. **Mr. Seaman** asked how much money is in Consolidated Account. **Supervisor Hyde** stated that has nothing to do with the Budget. **Mr. Seaman** asked again how much money is in the Consolidated Account? **Supervisor Hyde** replied we are not here to ask a variety of questions. We are here to talk about the Budget. This is a Public Hearing on the Budget. Please keep it to the Budget. **Mr. Seaman** again asked how much money is in the Consolidated Account. **Supervisor Hyde** responded **Mathew** do you understand this is a Public Hearing on the Budget. **Mr. Seaman** noted let me make it simpler how much money is in the General Fund? What is the Fund Balance? **Councilwoman Harris** noted you are out of order. We do not have to answer you, but we have to listen to your comments.

That is all. There is not a question and answer system going here. So when you understand that just give us your opinion that is all. Because all we have to do is listen to opinions. We don't have to answer questions. Because that is what this is. This is this kind of a meeting. Maybe you don't understand that, but that is what it is. It is not a Q & A. All it is is just your opinion, and we would love to hear it. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted he understands, but there is no basis for an opinion if you can't figure out what you have got. **Councilwoman Harris** noted you ask her when you get home. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted I don't know because I haven't been told.

Susan Shepler noted she had a question on the Town of Thurman 2019 Budget Summary page. You have a carry over for 2020 for the remainder of the (inaudible) amount. **Supervisor Hyde** noted you are here to tell us what your opinion is remember. We are not here for questions and answers. **Mrs. Shepler** noted well I would like to know why there is a carry over. But since you are not going to be able to explain that to me I am going to go ahead and tell you that I am not at all in favor of your revised 2019 Budget. I believe we should keep the Preliminary Budget which was approved by the Board at the last meeting. And keep it there. Things were gone over line item by line item, and they were corrected and adjusted. Everybody sat here and did it. It is frankly inappropriate for you to go ahead and do a revised 2019 Budget. **Supervisor Hyde** noted I would prefer if you would not make criticisms. This isn't a time to criticize. It is just a time to comment on the Budget. Keep the criticism down. **Mrs. Shepler** noted well that is an opinion on the Budget quite frankly. **Supervisor Hyde** noted that is a criticism not an opinion. **Mrs. Shepler** noted that is how you perceive it. But I believe we should stay with the 2019 Preliminary Budget.

Keith Parent noted as far as paying off this thing I believe that it would be best at this point to hold off until the January taxes come in and put it through the next year's Budget. I think that would be less of an impact to the taxpayers. That would delete any money we may have at this point. So I feel that should be put off until (inaudible). I mean last month when we had this meeting we saw some rather high increases. Some increases here and there nothing substantial. And that seemed to be OK so I think that this Budget could absorb the \$60,000.00 much easier than we could pay it off now and go without those funds. We are going to have those funds if we don't spend them. And if we need them, we need them. And if we don't have them it will roll over as far as next year.

Wini Martin asked can you tell us where we stand on this year's Budget or is that a question we are not allowed to ask? **Councilwoman Harris** asked what she had said noting she couldn't hear what she had said. **Mrs. Martin** repeated can you tell us where we stand with this year's Budget, or is that a question I am not allowed to ask? **Supervisor Hyde** noted we are talking about next year's Budget. I don't even know what you mean by that. **Councilwoman Harris** repeated where we stand on this year's Budget? **Mrs. Martin** noted right. A budget is what you say you are going to spend in the next year. Is that what.....**Supervisor Hyde** interrupted noting look at the Operating Statement. It is online. That will tell you everything you need to know. The Operating Statement is on the Document page of the Town website. **Mrs. Martin** asked so we are within the Budget this year that you had presented last year. **Supervisor Hyde** responded look at the Operating Statement. That will show you each code and where we are. Just look at it. That will answer your question. **Mrs. Martin** noted I am just asking you. **Supervisor Hyde** stated I am telling you that if you have some questions. If you would like to take the time to look. Go to the documents page. Pull up.....There is an Operating Statement. It is current up till yesterday. And in a few days I will make it current up to a few days from now. Go on there and that will answer all your questions. Take your Budget...There is also a Budget up there. On the home page there is a 2018 Budget. **Mrs. Martin** noted so you won't just say yes or no. **Supervisor Hyde** noted let me finish. Take the 2018 Budget, look at the Operating Statement, and you can see for yourself where we are. There are many codes. Compare them then you will have your answer. **Mrs. Martin** noted OK at this point I think we should stick with the Budget. The Preliminary Budget that was decided on by the full Board. I sat here for most of it. Everybody discussed it. I see no reason to bring another Budget here tonight which I understand is illegal. I say stay with the....**Supervisor Hyde** interrupted noting please do not say things like illegal. Please keep it to the Budget. **Wini**, keep it to the Budget. We are not here to say nasty things about people. Just keep it to talking about the Budget without the illegal (inaudible). **Mrs. Martin** replied you're interrupting me. Now can I speak. **Supervisor Hyde** noted we are not going to accuse people of being illegal at a Public Hearing. **Mrs. Martin** noted the second Budget you presented at....tonight is illegal. You can not present a Budget that no one has worked on. The Budget that the full Board worked on is the one that I like. This is a Public Hearing and I am giving my opinion. I tried to ask a question. You are asking for my opinion. My opinion is keep the

Budget that the whole Board worked on during the Workshop. It was approved. Everybody agreed for it, and I think the Budget you brought in tonight was illegal. I don't think you can do that. And I also think that you should have paid the full BAN following resolutions that the Board approved. And I believe that not following those resolutions are illegal also. **Supervisor Hyde** noted let me remind you we are not here to criticize people. Stick to the Budget. I am not criticizing people. I am saying the action you did was illegal. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Mrs. Martin** you are using this time of a Public Hearing to put people down. Please refrain from doing that. **Councilwoman Harris** noted OK she gave her opinion.

Debra McIlrath noted we need to be very careful when we make statements like illegal. **Councilwoman Harris** reminded her to stick to the Budget please. **Mrs. McIlrath** noted I have observed time and time again as many of us have that we have had many attempts to clarify issues, and we need to respect what we have had a chance to learn. And we need to respect the work of those who are here time and time again to make it work. And we need to take into account all that was explained in those meetings and non-meetings. Because all of that was about making everything work as efficiently as possible for the good of the whole town. We need to set aside our personal differences. Both **Councilwoman Harris and Seaman** reminded her that she had to stick to the Budget. **Mrs. McIlrath** noted do what is good for the Town. That is what the Budget should be about is doing what is good for all concerned.

Rich Morasse noted just one question. **Councilwoman Harris** noted no questions. **Mr. Morasse** noted it is not really a question. I am listening to what you are proposing. To raise the taxes next year to pay off the 60 odd thousand that we owe. Because the State is going to pay 37% of that. Now if we utilize the money that we already have raised in taxes didn't the State already pay 37% of that money already. I mean Mary did mention sales tax. I don't know how much that amounts to. Is it a big enough portion that it is worth our while like you are proposing to raise it next years taxes. **Councilwoman Harris** asked do you agree or disagree with that. **Mr. Morasse** noted I don't know. Because I don't know how much we are gathering in sales tax. You know that is not coming like you said from the State. What I am saying is if we raise it for next year 37% of that will be paid by the State, and if we don't do that we take money we already have. I am assuming that 37% of that money also came from the State already. I am blindsided here by what is the true benefit. **Supervisor Hyde** noted no. A lot of the extra money that was not appropriated

is from sales tax, we got a lot. We did real well on sales tax this year. The two Budgets, the Preliminary and the one that I put next to it. The tax rate is exactly the same. So you are not paying any more. It is just some numbers are different. **Mrs. Martin** asked if you are going to explain to him....**Supervisor Hyde** noted I am not answering a question. I don't think that everybody understands that one Budget is exactly the same tax rate as the other Budget. Cause it is the same exact tax rate. The Tentative had a bigger tax rate because it had raising the BAN in the Budget. **Mrs. Martin** noted you are answering a question from one person and not another. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted yes, that is exactly right. You are. **Supervisor Hyde** noted I am not really answering a question I am just trying to clarify that point. **Councilwoman Harris** noted we just want your opinion. **Mr. Morasse** noted I sort of follow. Well my opinion would be if the State is going to end up paying more towards what we owe by doing it later than by doing it now I would rather see the money come from the State, but I am not so sure that that is what is happening.

Joyce Eddy noted she was looking at this and wondering why the Board chose to raise money for a clerk in the Assessor's Office, and yet only give the Assessor half of what was originally budgeted. And I have only one statement to make about that as a taxpayer that by depleting that office. **Councilwoman Ackley** noted we didn't change that. That says **Cynthia's** revised. Ours it wasn't changed. **Mrs. Eddy** noted no, no I am not talking about **Cynthia's** revised Budget. I am talking about the Board passing the money for the Assessor which in 2017. **Councilwoman Ackley** noted yes and we left it the same way. **Supervisor Hyde** noted let her finish. **Councilwoman Ackley's** response was inaudible. **Supervisor Hyde** noted I don't think she is finished though. **Mrs. Eddy** continued so therefore my opinion is on the taxes is by not having that office fully covered so that the Assessor himself can go out and assess some of the buildings that are being processed without permits it will show up on our taxes next year. And that will be the Boards dilemma.

Mathew Seaman noted although it sounds like there could be benefits to pushing the BAN off until next year I am not convinced that the town has at the moment that the town has permission to do that. At least the way that I understand the loan was set up as a BAN. When that money came due, and it couldn't be done in part unless the Town had permission from the Comptroller before hand, but we never got that. And we also never got the Home Rule request. So I don't think although this sounds like (inaudible) perhaps money. I don't think or I am not sure that the town has permission to in fact do that.

Mary Eddy noted if the Town goes under the assumption that they can pay this in January. And then use the 22,000 that is going to be raised by New York State they can keep the fund balance for any...Because there is no savings account which has been used up. They would have some money to fall back on if there is no equipment or no truck. Because the trucks are, I believe the latest one was bought in 2008. So these trucks are ten years old. What are we going to use to buy a new truck if they break down? And two year ago they were down to three trucks in one storm because they were breaking down, and they have gone that many more miles. So it makes sense to keep some fund balance in case of emergency with the Highway.

Susan Shepler noted just going off what **Mary** said having a surplus, not a surplus, but an additional amount of money left over to cover the Highway Department. If you kept the Preliminary Budget that was voted on already you could pay them back the 57,800 and change out of the excess money that you have for taxes already, and then that would allow them to have a slight cushion. Not much, but a slight cushion which is a good thing for them to have considering the age of the vehicles and depending on the winter that we have, but that would give them what they need.

Mary Eddy noted I have one more comment. The people still fail to realize that the \$57,800.00 that keeps going back and forth to the Highway came out of the General Fund in the first place. And it is not supposed to be the General Fund paying for the Highway. They paid for the Highway. They just got it back. It was reimbursed already. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted this isn't on the Budget. **Mrs. Eddy** stated that is on the Budget. **Councilwoman Seaman** said that is not on the Budget. **Councilwoman Ackley** noted you can't take from the Highway account. **Mrs. Eddy** noted yes you can. They did it in the previous administration. 85,000 out of.....**Supervisor Hyde** interrupted noting **Mary, Mary, Mary**. **Mrs. Eddy** noted they did it previously without any resolution, and it can be proved. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Mary** that is enough.

Paula Hubert noted after listening to all this I really think the last meeting when we discussed the Budget, we spent a lot of time on it. I think we should stick to what we discussed, and not have this change from the one you use tonight. There was agreement. I think everything went well, and I think we should stay with those figures instead of this new one.

Wes Ramsey noted my opinion of is **Gail** should be paid what she is worth, and **Sue Baker** should also get paid to do a job. Instead of having to volunteer out of the kindness of her heart she won't let the town down.

With everyone desiring to be heard, having been heard the **Public Hearing** closed at **7:03pm**.

There was a question if there was a need to call a motion to adjourn.

Supervisor Hyde noted that it was a Public Hearing. I don't know that you have to adjourn a Public Hearing. **Councilwoman Ackley** noted you brought a resolution that didn't even vote to pay for or not to pay for it. **Councilwoman Harris** noted that was tabled. That is yesterday's news. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted in all actuality I think we should go through and defund these other lines. **Supervisor Hyde** noted no I think we have to close the Public Hearing. We close the Public Hearing. So this closes the Public Hearing, and this....**Councilwoman Ackley** asked if we were going to start another meeting? Is that what (inaudible). **Councilwoman Seaman** noted no we never closed the last one. **Supervisor Hyde** noted no, we weren't.... I don't know that **Mrs. Seaman**... She wasn't ready with her resolution to.... I have a resolution to pay off the BAN if the Board decides they don't want to pay it off in the Budget. I gave that to everybody. It is the same resolution that I brought to the last four meetings. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted OK can I have the original resolution that we needed to back and defund the lines. And then refund them what you needed, what you spent on the lines that were already been defunded. **Supervisor Hyde** noted that if you have a resolution that needed Budget changes you should have prepared it ahead of time. **Councilwoman Seaman** stated **Cynthia** this is the changes. You have to go back to July. Defund all of these lines. Because you don't get to have it both ways. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Mrs. Seaman** if you propose a resolution then you need to put that in writing, and then the Board can vote on it. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted **Cynthia** I did put it in writing. It is in writing. **Supervisor Hyde** asked isn't that the same resolution? **Councilwoman Seaman** responded yes, and you already executed part of it. You can't do.....**Supervisor Hyde** interrupted noting well **Mrs. Seaman** that is an old resolution. That resolution has been acted on. **Councilwoman Seaman** responded no you didn't because the BAN would have been paid off if you did. **Councilman Needham** repeated it would have been paid in full. (Inaudible) that we passed and we wouldn't be doing this now.

Councilwoman Seaman stated we are trying to help you. **Supervisor Hyde** stated I have a suggestion. Why doesn't the Town Board....I have provided the Town Board with spread sheets. I have given them links to everything online I don't know why you cannot understand that your resolution did not provide for me to be able to disperse the amount of money that you thought it was going to provide. You didn't pay attention to what you were doing. You didn't pay attention to the numbers. **Councilman Needham** interrupted noting maybe we ought to call the lawyer and have a meeting with him, and have him tell us what we are doing wrong. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted maybe we should have the lawyer come and explain this. **Supervisor Hyde** asked **Doug** can you take \$6,000.00 out of \$2,000.00? **Councilwoman Seaman** noted I agree. I agree. I agree that we need have the attorney here. **Councilman Needham** noted have the attorney here and then we can settle it. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted, agreed then we will settle it. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Doug** the attorney can't help you. **Councilman Needham** noted I am sick of arguing about this thing alright. The whole Board is. **Councilwoman Seaman** agreed the Board was. **Councilman Needham** continued noting the Town is. It is all we have been hearing about for 6 months. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Doug** the attorney cannot do resolutions for you. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted he can tell us if this is legal, and you have to follow it. **Supervisor Hyde** stated the Attorney has that resolution. **Councilwoman Seaman** stated yeah and he told you to pay it. **Councilman Needham** stated he told you to pay it and you didn't. So we can get him in here again, and maybe this time you will pay it. **Supervisor Hyde** responded no **Doug**. The Attorney told me to look at the resolution to take what I could take, and pay what I could take. I did exactly what the attorney said **Doug**. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted the Attorney told you you can't do part of a resolution. You have to go by what the Town Board tells you. **Supervisor Hyde** noted you don't know what you are talking about. The Attorney saw this resolution. The Attorney advised me what to do. I did what the Attorney said for me to do. Your resolution did not provide to pay that BAN off. **Councilwoman Seaman** responded yes it did. **Supervisor Hyde** noted the resolutions numbers were not accurate. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted why do you think it is written there. Do you want to read that she asked **Councilman Needham** who noted you don't have to. **Supervisor Hyde** noted you need to compare it to the June Operating Statement. Compare it with June. **Councilwoman Seaman** stated you didn't give us the June Operating Statement until after this resolution was written. **Supervisor Hyde** noted you

had the June Operating Statement when you did that resolution. You just didn't look at it. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted yes **Cynthia** did for a long time. **Supervisor Hyde** noted I am sorry but you had the June Operating Statement. **Councilwoman Seaman** looked at **Councilman Needham** and asked are you ready to go? **Councilman Needham** responded I am ready. **Councilwoman Seaman** stated I am ready. **Councilman Needham** stated it is not a meeting anyway. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted this isn't a meeting it is a back and forth. **Supervisor Hyde** noted so in other words the Board is once again not going to make any decision on paying off the balance of this BAN. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted I just said that you've got the resolution. **Councilman Needham** noted you already have got the.....**Supervisor Hyde** noted no **Mrs. Seaman** your resolution doesn't provide for me to pay the entire amount of the BAN off. **Councilwoman Seaman** interrupted to say yeah it does. **Supervisor Hyde** continued noting it only provided for 242 whatever thousand dollars. That is what was paid. You cannot take \$19,000.00 out of unallocated insurance when there is only 2,000 something left in it, and the 2,000 left in it was for the inland marine policy. You were willing with your resolution to take \$19,000.00 out of the \$20,000.00 that was budgeted for unallocated insurance. Had we done that the Highway Department would not have had any of their vehicles covered. What kind of a resolution do you people think you are writing here. You also tried to take... Don't smile **Doug**. **Councilman Needham** stated get the lawyer here. **Supervisor Hyde** continued your resolution would have ended up with those guys not being able to operate the Highway Department because you were trying to take all the money from unallocated insurance which pays for all of...**Councilman Needham** stated I have heard this all five times. I have heard this five times I am sick of hearing it Good Bye he stated as he got up and stood at the door. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted I think we should have the Attorney here. **Supervisor Hyde** noted your resolution did not make sense. I am sorry you don't understand that **Doug**. **Councilman Needham** replied I do understand that. Get the lawyer here so we can talk to him then. **Supervisor Hyde** noted I am not calling... The taxpayers are not going to pay the lawyer to come here and tell us what he already told us. Both **Councilwoman Seaman** and **Councilman Needham** noted he told you to pay the bill because of the resolution. **Supervisor Hyde** noted the lawyer does not (**Councilman Needham left the meeting**) tell the Town Supervisor what action to take. The Town Board does. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted but you didn't do it. **Supervisor**

Hyde stated but the Town Board has to give the Supervisor a legitimate place to take the money from. In order for the Supervisor to act on it **Mrs. Seaman. Councilwoman Seaman** was constantly noting we did as the **Supervisor** spoke. **Supervisor Hyde** noted and your resolution was mostly a bunch of garbage. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted well the Attorney told you to pay it didn't he? **Supervisor Hyde** stated **Mrs. Seaman** we saw tonight that you couldn't even read the bank statement. **Councilwoman Harris** noted he said pay what she could, and was legal. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted no he didn't. He told her to pay it. **Supervisor Hyde** stated I paid what I could. End of story. I cannot pay anymore. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted **Cynthia** you have (inaudible) something up there that.....**Supervisor Hyde** noted you guys have to come up with a different suggestion. I have given you suggestions over and over and over again. You refuse to come to meetings. You refuse to act upon it. **Councilwoman Seaman** asked **Cynthia** do you want to defund all of these lines first so that we can refund what you need to.....**Supervisor Hyde** interrupted asking do I have a motion to get a resolution to approve a Budget modification and pay the remaining BAN balance to Glens Falls National Bank. Do I have a motion? she asked. It was noted that **Councilwoman Ackley** had both moved and seconded the motion, but was not heard. It was agreed that **Councilwoman Harris** would move the resolution and **Councilwoman Ackley** would second it.

Resolution # 123

On a motion introduced by **Councilwoman Harris** and seconded by **Councilwoman Ackley**

RESOLUTION TO APPROVE BUDGET MODIFACATION AND PAY REMAINING BAN BALANCE TO GFNB

Decrease General Fund Unassigned Fund Balance A917.01

\$59,964.55

Increase V fund Ban Notes Payable 626.15

\$59,964.55

Note: Amount is payoff of balance Friday November 09, 2018

Motion Carried: Ayes~3 Ackley, Harris, Seaman, Nays~1 Seaman, Absent~1 Needham

Councilwoman Seaman noted OK I am done. You just passed an illegal resolution. Get the attorney here **Cynthia. Brenda** just so you know you just now negated the (inaudible) July 11th. **Supervisor Hyde** noted she would be paying the bank tomorrow. Just to let you know here this amount is \$59,964.55 I called the bank today and I asked them to give me the amount as of tomorrow so that I had the exact amount. That amount \$59,964.55 is the balance as of tomorrow. We are going to decrease the General Fund Unassigned Balance A917.01 we are going to decrease that by \$59,964.55 we are going to increase the V Fund BAN note payable by, which is the number is 626.15 and we are going to increase that by the same amount which is \$59,964.55. And I will be paying that tomorrow. Thank you **Brenda**.

Councilwoman Harris stated thank you **Brenda**. The **Town Clerk** noted that we actually gave the Board members in a packet several months ago an opinion from the Committee on Open Government that they should not be springing these resolutions at the last minute. **Supervisor Hyde** noted that is true. The **Town Clerk** continued there is no public input for this. They are violating Open Meeting Laws when they do that. Those should only happen in an emergency that resolutions are brought up on the floor without any public notice. Without them being posted. Without the Supervisor, the Town Clerk or the rest of the Board seeing them.

The meeting ended at **7:13 pm** with all Board Members having left.

Respectfully Submitted,

Susan E Staples, Town Clerk

December 19, 2018

Attachments

THE REVISED TOWN OF THURMAN 2019 BUDGET

The Revised 2019 budget stays under the tax cap, pays the balance owed to Glens Falls National Bank **AND** has the same tax rate as the Preliminary 2019 Budget. The revisions were done with several things in mind

1. The voting record of the Ackley, Needham and Seaman.
2. The absence of a rational plan to pay the \$60,000.00 balance owed to GFNB on the BAN.
3. The impropriety of raising taxes for positions that the majority of the board refuses to fill.
4. The need to stay under the tax cap and have a plan to pay off the BAN.
5. The inappropriate discrimination shown in the preliminary budget salaries.
6. The need to try to reduce taxes in the highway fund through attrition.

A1120 NON-PROPERTY TAX DISTRIBUTION:
The changes from 2019 Preliminary to the Revised 2019 Preliminary Budget are as follows:

2019 REVISED BUDGET - we decreased what we anticipate this revenue to bring in next year to protect ourselves against a drop in sales tax collected. We have to be careful not to overestimate as there are good years and bad years.

A1010.4 TOWN BOARD CONTRACTUAL:

2019 REVISED BUDGET- this line was decreased from \$3,000 to \$1,000, at the end of October with 3 months left to go, there was still 2,417.00 out of the 3,000.00 budgeted left.

A1010.1, A1110.1, A1111.12, A1220.1, A1220.12, A1310.1, A1330.1, A1355.1, A1410.1, A4020.1, AS010.1 Salaries:

2019 TENTATIVE BUDGET - The 2019 Tentative Budget gave a salary increase to all elected and appointed officials because there hasn't been a salary increase since 2013.

2019 PRELIMINARY BUDGET - The 2019 Preliminary Budget took the salary increases away from 6 officials and gave the salary increases to 3 of the officials, without any justification as to WHY. This is discrimination.

2019 REVISED BUDGET - in an effort to be fair the revised preliminary takes all of the increases out because it is discriminatory to give salary increases to 3 officials and no salary increases to the other 6 officials.

A1355.12 ASSESSOR CLERK PS:

2019 TENTATIVE BUDGET - the 2019 Tentative Budget gave the Sole Appointed Assessor a salary of \$23,000.00.

2019 PRELIMINARY BUDGET - The 2019 Preliminary Budget cut the Sole Appointed Assessor salary to \$11,000 and raises \$11,000 for an assessor clerk. The assessor clerk position was deleted at the beginning of 2018 by a three vote majority (Ackley, Needham Seaman). Councilwoman Seaman stated that she wanted to raise \$11,000 in the budget for an assessor clerk but has no plans on allowing Susan Baker to fill the position. Mrs. Seaman also insisted on keeping the assessor at the low salary of \$11,000.00.

2019 REVISED BUDGET - It isn't fair to the taxpayers to raise money for an assessor clerk position that the majority of the board has no intention of filling, so in the revised budget this line was reduced to \$0.00. I believe we need both Tuck Birdsall and Susan Baker in that office but it is evident by the voting record of Ackley, Needham and Seaman that they refuse to provide the assessor's office with the resources needed to do the job. Throughout this year I brought numerous resolutions to the board to pay Susan Baker to serve as the assessor clerk and each time the three board members voted no.

A1410.12 Deputy Town Clerk PS:

2019 TENTATIVE BUDGET - The Tentative Budget gave a salary increase {\$4,200) to the Deputy Town Clerk line in hopes that this coming year the town board majority (Ackley, Needham Seaman) would actually pay Deputy Town Clerk Susan Baker for her service in the Town Clerk's office.

2019 PRELIMINARY BUDGET - The Preliminary Budget raises \$4,000 on that line but Councilwoman Seaman makes it clear that Susan Baker would not be paid.

2019 REVISED BUDGET - It isn't fair to the taxpayers to raise money for a deputy town clerk when the majority of the board (Ackley, Needham Seaman) has no intention of paying Deputy Town Clerk Susan Baker. In the revised budget this line was reduced to \$0.00. In the beginning of 2018 the town board majority (Ackley, Needham Seaman) voted to make the deputy clerk an unpaid position. Throughout this year I brought numerous resolutions to the board to pay Deputy Clerk Susan Baker and each time the three board members voted no. I believe that Deputy Town Clerk Susan Baker should be paid, I know that for years all Thurman deputy Town Clerks received pay, I know that deputy town clerks in other towns are paid; it is a shame to be witness to this shameful discrimination against Susan Baker.

A1620.1 Buildings PS:

2019 REVISED BUDGET- This line was reduced for this year in an effort to keep under the taxcap and because it is more than has been needed. This line pays for a cleaner and a maintenance man, these two positions were deleted this year by the town board majority (Ackley, Needham Seaman) and we are not sure if they will be back. The revised budget provides enough funds for bringing the cleaner and the maintenance man back should that be the will of the board.

A9060.8 Medical Insurance:

2019 REVISED BUDGET: We could reduce this by \$1,000 and still meet our general fund medical insurance expenses.

DA5110.1 General repairs PS:

2019 REVISED BUDGET: This line was decreased by \$60,000.00 to reduce taxes in the highway fund through attrition.

DA5130.4 Machinery contractual

2019 TENTATIVE BUDGET: This line was at 25,000.00

2019 PRELIMINARY BUDGET: This line was increased to \$50,000.00

2019 REVISED BUDGET: This line was increased to \$64,000.00. The highway operates with very old equipment it is hoped that with the help of reductions because of attrition, more could be spent on machinery.

HI 626 BAN Notes Payable

HI 9730.7 BAN Interest Payable

2019 TENTATIVE BUDGET: HI 626 BAN Notes Payable **\$57,430** and HI 9730.7 BAN Interest Payable **\$2,826**

2019 PRELIMINARY BUDGET: HI 9730.7 BAN Interest Payable **\$0.00** and HI 9730.7 BAN Interest Payable **\$0.00**

2019 REVISED BUDGET: HI 626 BAN Notes Payable **\$57,430** and HI 9730.7 BAN Interest Payable **\$2,826**. The revised budget pays the balance of the BAN, stays under the tax cap **AND** has the **SAME** tax rate as the preliminary.

Note: New York State pays 37% of the January tax levy. Therefore if the balance of the BAN is raised in taxes in the 2019 budget New York State gets to pay 37% of the balance owed. The remaining balance owed to GFNB is \$60,256.00 so if raised in taxes New York State will pay \$22,295.83 of the balance owed and we (the taxpayers) would pay \$37,960.17 of the balance owed. If we pay the balance owed GFNB this year out of our fund balance New York State pays nothing (\$0.00).

If we raise the balance of the BAN in the 2019 Budget we will retain a comfortable fund balance. If the board could be convinced of the value of Susan Baker in the Assessor's Office, which is the financial foundation of the town and the value of Susan Baker in the Town Clerk's Office, which is the office that protects your right to know. fund balance could be moved to the Assessor Clerk PS code and the Deputy Town Clerk PS code.

The town board's deletion of the Assessor Clerk severely affected the Assessor Office. It is difficult to maintain an equalization rate of 100 and hard to keep up with residents exemptions.

Thank You)
Cynthia R. Hyde