MINUTES OF THE REGULAR BOARD MEETING OF THE TOWN BOARD OF THE TOWN OF THURMAN, NY HELD NOVEMBER 14, 2018 AT THE TOWN HALL, 311 ATHOL ROAD, ATHOL, NEW YORK, COMMENCING AT 6:30 PM.....

PRESENT: Mrs. Brenda Ackley, Councilwoman

Mrs. Joan Harris, Councilwoman

Mrs. Gail Seaman, Councilwoman

Mrs. Cynthia Hyde, Supervisor

ABSENT: Mr. Douglas Needham, Councilman

ALSO PRESENT: Nadab Bhatti: National Business Technologies, Fred Englemann

RECORDING SECRETARY: Susan E Staples

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG:

ROLL CALL:

The meeting started with the review of claims. The meeting was called to order at **7:00pm.**

The meeting started with a presentation by **Nadab Bhutti** who gave a presentation on what his company does, and where they do business. He explained the presentation he had put together to the Board explaining the benefits of switching to National for our printer needs.

Fred Englemann reported that the University of Albany had completed the Network repairs, and the system was up and running as it was when it was first completed. He noted that if you look to the future about capacity and speed upgrades. He noted capacity upgrades are upgrading the system as a whole, and individual componets. He noted that speed upgrades is something that an operator would do to upgrade speeds for the subscribers. He noted that a couple of months ago Cynthia had reached out to Frontier to confirm the terms and duration of the existing contract for the Fiber Direct Internet access connections at the poles. And also to find out if it was possible to lower the cost to the town. Over the years prices of fiber has come down. It was not possible to lower the cost that the town pays every month, but Frontier was actually pretty generous about bringing the speeds up to parody with what the cost are today. So we

currently have the town at a 20 by 20 megabit per second fiber connection, and what Frontier is willing to do with no changes to the terms of the contract, and no changes to the cost. The monthly cost at all, they are willing to upgrade the speed to 50 by 50. So two and a half times the existing speed. That provides a huge increase in capacity for the system overall. He noted that Frontier had some sort of agreement that they would like si gned. He noted that be believed that it was included in the Board's packets. He noted that if Frontier is offering to bring speed up to parody with current speed levels for the same price and the same term. The contract ends on the same date. Nothing has changed. It sounds like a good deal. So I wanted to present that to the Board and public. Supervisor Hyde noted to Mr. Englemann that she had not seen in the attachments a document. He noted that he was sure there was a document to be signed that would reflect that everything stay the same except the speeds (inaudible). Mr. Englemann answered questions from the residents explaining the increases in capacity and speed. He also noted that by upgrading the Firmware on both radio systems (Carlson and Point to Point) that the Whitespace uses it would increase both the capacity and efficiency of the subscriber links at each sector. It would also increase of the transport over to Combs Road. He noted that he had a collaboration with Microsoft CR band innitative which is in support of TV Whitespace globally. He noted that that encompasses a number of rural Broadband projects in the Adirondack Park which will start building out in the spring. So I have requested if we can use some of the resources available to that collaboration to pay for the upgrades, and for the Firmware updates to the town equipment. So there would be no cost to the town to upgrade the capacity for those things. Councilwoman Seaman asked if the current subscribers equipment would work with the new upgrades because it is four to five years past. Mr. **Englemann** noted yes, that once you upgrade the base station it automatically upgrades the subscribers equipment. Councilwoman Seaman asked so it automatically goes through and updates the subscribers equipment. They don't have any more cost. Nothing else. Mr. Englemann agreed. Councilwoman **Seaman** noted OK that is what I wanted to know. **Mr. Englemann** noted so that is the news that I wanted to share. I don't know if you need a resolution to approve more free work. I should point out that the free repairs are complete. There will be no more free repairs. There are free Firmware updates available that would increase capacity, and there is an offer from Frontier to increase capacity at no

additional cost to the town. Supervisor Hyde noted that she thought the Board should take Frontier up on their offer. Councilwoman Seaman noted why don't we hold off until all of the presentations are done so we can discuss it. Mr. **Englemann** answered some questions from the residents about funding for the grant, speed of the system, and general questions regarding Whitespace. He noted that there were about 97 homes that had a signal that would most likely be covered by service. It was also noted that the original size of the project would not change. Councilwoman Harris noted so what you are telling us is we are getting more service free if we want it. Mr. Englemann replied yes, and he noted that the increase in speed to the subscriber, that is above and beyond the Firmware updates. That is an operator going in there and changing settings and configuration of the gateway. Councilwoman Harris noted so you need an operator. Mr. Englemann noted you need an operator to take advantage of those capacity, and pass those higher speed along to the subscribers (inaudible). Councilwoman Seaman noted OK so it is not free then. Mr. Englemann noted what I talked about was in fact free to the town. It was increasing capacity of receptors, of the transport and of the fiber. Councilwoman Seaman asked and we have to pay the operator? Mr. Englemann noted not to do that. The funding is coming from my collaboration with Microsoft Airband initiative. Councilwoman **Seaman** stated OK that was what I was wondering. **Mr. Englemann** stated if you want to increase the speed to subscribers then an operator would have to do that. Councilwoman Seaman noted but that is what you were talking about doing. Mr. Englemann noted no I was not. I was talking about capacity not speed to the system. Councilwoman Seaman noted oh OK so it has nothing to do with the subscribers and OK.....Mr. Englemann noted it makes it available to the subscribers if the town ever chooses to incresase the speed of the subscribers. All you have to do is find an operator. Supervisor Hyde noted that is something I have a resolution on tonight is to hopefully come to an agreement on an operator because we have this network all up and running, and I do know that I have been contacted and told that there are some people who are anxious to subscribe. In order to get our revenues coming in, and to get more revenues we are going to have to have somebody operating this Whitespace network. As everyone knows we will have to keep paying it for several more years. So is there anything that you would like to say about that you are the.... Mr. Englemann noted no I did submit a proposal in August of 2018 I think it was. I think the town had gone out

to bid three times for an operator and, the first two had no response. The third time there was a response. Supervisor Hyde noted right, and I have that proposal here, and I have a resolution in the packet tonight for the board to decide on hiring an operator or not. Councilwoman Seaman asked can you tell me what changed between June 12th and July when you submitted that proposal to operate the system. Mr. Englemann noted yeah actually I started getting and correspondence with Brenda Ackley, and she was very reasonable. So I thought perhaps the Board was turning around. **Councilwoman Seaman** asked OK so that was the... in two weeks that happened? Just wondering. Mr. Englemann noted she asked some good questions. I was happy to answer them. Councilwoman **Seaman** noted everybody asks good questions. **Mr. Englemann** stated reasonable intelligent questions. Councilwoman Harris noted more speed free, more capacity with an operator. Mr. Englemann noted the operator would increase speeds to the subscribers. Councilwoman Seaman noted but on the other hand we only have 6 people on the system right now. Mr. Englemann noted there are actually 18 connected subscribers devices. I'm not sure how many people are using them. There were 3 or 4 people who moved to satellite, but we have a good dozen people using it. We were up to 32. There is no reason that we can't get back up to that. **Supervisor Hyde** noted we need an operator to get it back up. Councilwoman Seaman stated well right now we only have \$300.00 a month coming in in revenue so that is according to your sheet. \$300.00 a month. Supervisor Hyde noted that is because the internet was down, and we didn't have an operator. That is the whole....That is one of the reasons why we wanted to get it up and running, and hopefully get an operator. The only way to increase our revenue is to have it working, and to have an operator to fix it or hook people up. We have no way of increasing our revenue without an operator. Councilwoman **Seaman** stated That is great. I understand that. We also have SLIC coming in, and they are coming in the first of the year. They are already running lines. They are up through Stoney Creek, and they are coming down right through here, and I do know people who are on Whitespace right now who are not going to be on Whitespace when SLIC comes down the road. **Supervisor Hyde** noted we are talking about Whitespace. Mr. Englemann noted we certainly expect people to move over to SLIC. It is a better offering. A resident noted that SLIC would not be coming to all of the homes served by Whitespace. Councilwoman Seaman stated some. Mr. Englemann also noted some. There are places that they can't reach

(inaudible). **Councilwoman Seaman** noted that SLIC was supposed to be here tomorrow night, but that there was some type of a conflict. So they are going to be rescheduling. But I do know that....I was told that Hughes Net was going to be on part of the grant, but Hughes Net could not reach the requirements for the upload speeds and download speeds so they did not sign any contracts. So they were seriously considering transferring those areas over to SLIC. Mr. Englemann noted actually the State awarded \$14,000,000.00 to Hughes Net to cover the installation cost to 76,000 homes in New York. Councilwoman Seaman noted right. Mr. Englemann continued that contract is still in place. Councilwoman **Seaman** noted they didn't sign it for here though, and you know that. **Mr. Englemann** noted well no, carriers bid on census blocks, and those carriers look at the census block and said if we provide service here we are guaranteed to loose money every month choose not to bid on the census block. In the end the state said all these unserved census blocks will be Hughes Net. So they calculated a contract \$14,000,000.00 for Hughes. And I should note that if you sign up for Hughes today and have a two or three year contract they waive the installation fee anyway. So why send \$14,000,000.00 to the company I don't know. Councilwoman Seaman noted I have no idea, but I do know I was told they did not sign that contract. At least to provide it in this area. So that they were seriously considering giving it over. **Mr. Englemann** noted they didn't bid on this area. He noted to a resident so the only area here besides your house was Dippikill. Councilwoman Seaman noted well they reported some in this area. Mr. Englemann noted no they....In Thurman. Councilwoman Seaman noted yeah. Mr. Englemann continues there is actually a map that my colleague built for (inaudible), and it actually shows the awarded census blocks, and who is covering. Right noted Councilwoman Seaman. Mr. Englemann continued not the New York State Broadband. It is a private (inaudible) map. So that is new (inaudible) this year. And Hughes Net had no coverage in here except for Dippikill Road. Councilwoman Seaman stated well it also had some coverage on some of the other roads. I know some people who were told that is who is covering them. Mr. **Englemann** noted that's (shaking his head no)....No you don't have the right map. I'm sorry. Councilwoman Seaman replied I do, but it doesn't matter. Supervisor **Hyde** noted **Gail**, I think we better let SLIC when they come in tell us what is what. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted my only concern is we have 6 people currently paying on the system. If we go to a..... Award a contract to a operator that is going

to take half of that \$300.00, and we owe \$950.00 a month to Frontier. So that is going to further decrease what we have to pay Frontier. Mr. Englemann noted until we get subscribers. Councilwoman Seaman noted well the point of it is, is that Albany gave the money once to fix the system because they needed it for their research. So I would assume that there is a possibility that they would want to keep that running to maintain their research for four years. That way they would also provide money again if the system would go down. Mr. Englemann noted that he could not speak for the University. You could ask them if they would be willing to provide more money to the town. I don't see why they would. Councilwoman Seaman stated I don't see why they wouldn't if they want to continue their research because they have already invested in it. So that would be the logical course of event. Mr. Englemann noted that is very supportive of research in the National Science Foundation Gail. Councilwoman Seaman noted I'm just... That's the bottom line for Thurman. Mr. Englemann asked her are you suggesting shutting it down. Supervisor Hyde asked so Gail what do you suggest we do with Whitespace. Forget about it? Councilwoman Seaman replied it's running. It is perfect. If the University of Albany.....Supervisor Hyde noted it is not running without an operator Mrs. Seaman. Councilwoman Seaman replied it's running. It has been running without an operator. Supervisor Hyde asked what about the people who would like to subscribe to Whitespace? Without an operator that is an impossibility. Councilwoman Seaman noted well we haven't heard of anybody that wants to subscribe right now. As a matter of fact there are people on Whitespace as soon as the Fiber Optic is coming is going to drop it. **Supervisor Hyde** asked so you are telling me that you..... That the Town Board, of which you were a part of, did all this work to get a \$200,000.00 grant, and now you are willing to just drop it. Councilwoman Seaman noted no it is not me dropping it. Mr. Englemann noted excuse me did anyone contact the 97 households that we have on the map to see if they would be interested in signing up? Councilwoman Seaman noted I believe you did (pointing to Mr. Englemann) at one point. Mr. Englemann responded no I did not. Councilwoman Seaman stated yes, you did. Or actually there was someone from one of the colleges that sent out the surveys because they did it for free. Mr. Englemann noted that was before we built the Whitespace project. That was before we built it. Supervisor **Hyde** asked **Councilwoman Seaman** what are you suggesting. Are you suggesting that we do nothing about Whitespace any longer? Councilwoman Seaman noted I

am suggesting that due to the fact that A it is not in your Budget how to pay for the \$14,000.00 that we are going to be paying for Frontier that we don't give up subscriber fees at this particular point We haven't had a subscriber since January. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Mrs. Seaman** we had subscribers at the end of last year. The reason that the subscribers dropped off was because the new Town Board refused to continue with the old operator, and wanted to go out to bid. Councilwoman Seaman interrupted noting that is not true. Supervisor Hyde continued so our revenue dropped because we did not have an operator. So we are trying to get the operator back on board so that we can start bringing in other revenue. I think people who have Whitespace are very, very interested in seeing that it continue, and continues to run well. The town has an internet system we are expected to maintain it because of the grant that we got. And we are expected to pay the \$950.00, and we need an operator. I don't think that..... Councilwoman Seaman noted pardon me I was trying to talk, and I have (inaudible). Mr. Englemann asked I don't need to stay for that resolution actually. Do I. It was noted no. He continued asking if he had the Board's permission to do Firmware updates, and increase the capacity of the system? **Councilwoman Seaman** noted I would like to know a little bit more about those Firmware updates. Supervisor Hyde noted I would like to get a motion on the floor. Mr. **Englemann** noted again at no cost to the town. **Supervisor Hyde** noted I would like to get a motion on the floor to, word that for me. She stopped to note excuse me Mrs. Seaman please let someone else talk for a minute. Councilwoman Seaman stated you haven't had privilege of the floor, we haven't had privilege of the floor and now you are willing to do a motion when before we haven't had these motions. Supervisor Hyde replied this is a free thing. Mr. Englemann noted this is to apply firmware updates per the manufacturers recommendations. **Councilwoman Seaman** continued to interrupt noting and this wasn't given any notification to any of the people either. Supervisor Hyde asked do you have that Susan? The Town Clerk noted no Gail was speaking over him. Supervisor Hyde noted **Gail** we are really... We are trying to..... Please be guiet. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted so this is from the floor, and we don't.....**Mr. Englemann** came to the clerk to give the wording for the resolution. **Supervisor Hyde** asked is this the Frontier thing. Mr. Englemann noted no. That is just my collaboration. I was able to take resources with my existing collaboration with Microsoft Airband. With their permission. Use that to pay my cost of some manufacturers, not all of them

are free for upgrades. So this covers all the cost. The town doesn't have to pay for anything. Councilwoman Seaman noted I would just like to make sure that when these updates are done that any current subscribers equipment does not work it is your responsibility to fix it until it does. **Mr. Englemann** stated sure. Councilwoman Seaman continued in writing please. Mr. Englemann replied no. Councilwoman Seaman noted if it is not in writing it is not done. Supervisor Hyde asked do I have a motion to get this very nice offer on the floor? Councilwoman Seaman stated I have asked for something in writing. Supervisor Hyde asked do I have a motion. Councilwoman Seaman noted I have asked for something in writing. Unless it is in writing it is not done. Mr. Englemann noted the repairs are done. **Supervisor Hyde** again asked to bring the motion to the floor. Councilwoman Seaman noted I am more interested in the people who could be affected. Because I was told that the equipment would not function once upgrade to that system were completed. So I'm Councilwoman Harris noted if you are that informative (inaudible) everyone of the people who has Whitespace has to have a contract. In writing. In writing. Absolutely agreed Mr. Englemann. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted actually they do. **Mr. Englemann** stated no they don't. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted it is called the grant. The grant paperwork. It's the Connect New York State grant. That is why they pay \$50.00 a month for 5 years. **Supervisor Hyde** again asked to bring the motion to the floor. A resident asked about we said that we had 32 people at one point in time. By your figures Gail \$300.00 so that is 6 people. Mr. Englemann noted 6 people who are paying, not necessarily 6 people who are using it. That is another reason to get an operator. The resident wanted to know if now that the system was up and running that these 32 people had the ability to use the internet (Whitespace) again. Mr. Englemann noted that is true. The resident then asked if we had the ability to turn off the people who were not paying. Mr. Englemann replied yes. No I'm sorry with an operator you do. Supervisor Hyde noted with an operator you do. That was part of the problem last year. We didn't figure out they had it. The resident noted unless you fix that you won't fix anything. Mr. Englemann noted that is why you need an operator. **Supervisor Hyde** noted last year that is how we started getting our revenue to come in. Because people were using it, and they weren't paying. So we wrote them a letter, and said if you don't pay you are going (inaudible). The resident noted if he doesn't pay his Dish bill, or my DSL bill I don't have it. Supervisor Hyde noted that is what we did, and people started

paying. They started paying when we threatened to shut them off. It was noted that was what an operator would do. She again asked to get a motion to bring it to the floor. Councilwoman Ackley asked about the wording of the resolution. **Councilwoman Seaman** wanted to add that he will absolutely guarantee that all subscribers who are hooked up will be operational before and after. No responded Mr. Englemann. Councilwoman Seaman noted that is what you said before. You guaranteed they would be. Mr. Englemann noted you said would I fix it. You said would I fix it. Councilwoman Seaman noted OK then that means they may not be operational. Supervisor Hyde stated Mrs. Seaman they might think they are not operational, and it might be some other piece of equipment that they have to fix. Councilwoman Seaman stated that is not what he said. That's not what he said. **Supervisor Hyde** asked if the resolution stated at no cost to the town. Is that in there? The Clerk noted no I don't think it was. Do you want to add that part. Supervisor Hyde noted yes that is important. Councilwoman Seaman stated the important part is that he just said that they may not be operational the people who are currently on the system. Mr. Englemann stated he said I would not guarantee that they would be operational. Councilwoman Seaman stated so you will not guarantee that they will be operational? Nope replied Mr. **Englemann. Councilwoman Seaman** stated OK then we can't have you update any system because you won't guarantee that it will be operational. Mr. **Englemann** noted to **Councilwoman Seaman** this is what you were going to have (inaudible) Jennings from Carlson Wireless do. Remember? Is to do the exact same thing I am talking about. Councilwoman Seaman stated for free. Mr. **Englemann** replied yes, and you were going to have Shamus upgrade that. Who was going to guarantee that they would all work? At that time when you were ready to do it. Supervisor Hyde noted when Viking Electric.....Councilwoman Seaman noted (inaudible) problem saying they would absolutely guarantee the work. Supervisor Hyde again asked if we could have the vote. Councilwoman Ackley asked if they don't work after they do the upgrade give me a reason of why they wouldn't work. Mr. Englemann noted for example the alpha power got reduced because of the Firmware update to meet FCC regulations. That is how when Viking Electric had a update applied to the Garnet Lake radio and we lost (inaudible) because they were on the very fringe of the reception. The people who are on now have very strong signals. So if we drop the signal a little bit that we are not going to see a difference on that. I am fairly confident, and if we do we can downgrade the Firmware to where it was. We will have less capacity on that particular sector, but at least we will have longer range if necessary.

Councilwoman Seaman noted it will cost us. Mr. Englemann noted to down grade no. Councilwoman Seaman noted it will cost us to have you do it, the work. Mr. Englemann stated I'm sorry did I not make it clear there is no cost to the town. Councilwoman Seaman noted not when we were talking about the people who might not be working. That is not what you said. You said you would not guarantee that they would work. Supervisor Hyde asked if we could call the vote

RESOLUTION:

Resolution # 124

On a motion introduced by **Councilwoman Harris** and seconded by **Supervisor Hyde**

please. The **Town Clerk** asked if she was calling for a Roll Call Vote. The

Supervisor replied could you do a Roll Call please.

Resolution to apply Firmware updates according to the manufactures recommendations which will increase capacity of the system at no cost to the town.

Motion Carried: Ayes~3 Ackley, Harris, Hyde, Nays~1 Seaman

Discussion: Supervisor Hyde asked what about Frontier? **Mr. Englemann** noted it might be best to see what documentation they need, and put that in front of the Board and the public. So that it is perfectly clear that there is no change to service other than speed. Thank you for your time. A resident asked **Mr. Englemann** how many subscribers would be need for the town to be revenue neutral. He replied forty. A resident asked if **Mr. Englemann** saw a viable business plan over the long term. He responded that he doesn't see it as much of a business plan. I would get some revenue if I become the operator. The reason I started this whole thing five or six years ago was to hook up people who could not get hooked up. That is how (inaudible) started. That is why I am here tonight for the subscribers. The people need to be hooked up. If I can get them back up then I am doing my job. The resident asked if the system that he sold us was viable again. **Mr.Englemann** noted it was viable. It is serving people well, and it has been for years. It was

asked if there would be overlap with the coverage from SLIC. He noted that there would be. However, some people may choose to stay with Whitespace if there were to be higher installation fees due to length of driveway for example. He noted that subscribers also like being able to reach him personally on a Saturday night.

PRIVILEGE OF THE FLOOR: Privilege of the floor was granted. The following residents spoke. Debbie Horowitz, Debra Owens, Wini Martin, Rich Morrassy, Mary Eddy, Mathew Seaman, Sally Wallace, Susan Shepler, Debbie McIllrath, Keith Parent, Wes Ramsey, and Mary Eddy.

RESOLUTIONS:

Resolution

On a motion introduced by **Councilwoman Harris** and seconded by **Supervisor Hyde**

RESOLUTION TO REINSTATE ASSESSOR CLERK POSITION

The town board of the Town of Thurman reinstates the position of clerk to the assessor and appoints Susan Baker to fill the position.

Discussion: Councilwoman Seaman stated the position doesn't exist. In July it was eliminated. You were directed to remove it from the books. It cannot be filled without identifying the source of funding, and without then reapplying to create the position. **Supervisor Hyde** stated I am asking to reinstate the position. Then we will talk about the funding. Any other questions? Councilwoman Harris stated I think it is needed. People were screaming. We have no money, we have no money. The world is coming to an end, and so they fired everybody. And then they expect them to come back and they say well let her have the job, but let her volunteer. Now nobody volunteers in a municipality or any other area. You don't ask your people to come in and work an 8 hour shift, and then say volunteer to do it. We need the person. You are not only getting two assessors on the job, you are getting two professional people who are determining what your taxes are. And one can't be in the office if there is only one person there, and one can't take care of with a lot of the problems that come through. We had to throw away LUCA. Which we are going to loose on grant money when the census come around because we had nobody there to be able to (inaudible) that process. I think it has

to be covered like it always has been. We either give him \$22,000.00 and pay him in full or as they were willing to split the two, so they both could be there. That was a big generous part for an Assessor to serve his town for \$11,000.00. I bet you can't find a town to take that amount of money and work. So consequently I think we need to fill this position, and it is a vendetta against two or three people. Councilwoman Seaman noted it is not. Councilwoman Harris continued noting wait a minute. One of the Board Members told me particularly they don't want Tucker in there so they are going to take out Sue. And I said to that person why are you taking out the second level, because you vote out the first level. Supervisor Hyde and Councilwoman Seaman both noted no you can't. That is an appointed position. Councilwoman Harris continued so it is appointed OK. You can get him out of there anyway you want why go after the person who is helping him. They said well that was the easiest person to get. **Supervisor Hyde** noted that she would like to say that without the Assessor Clerk in the office, and with the Assessor only being paid \$11,000.00 the Assessor is kind of married to the office. He is not able to get out in the field because they have to be here for the Enhanced Star, the people coming in to ask questions. And it prevent his ability to be out in the field which prevents him from being able to get out and discover new buildings, new additions, new garages, and anything that anybody has built since the Assessors Clerk was deleted and the Assessor's salary was kept at only \$11,000.00. Anybody who has built something since this has happened is much less likely to find it on the Assessment Roll which is very unfair to the people who the people whose property and everything on their property is on the Assessment Roll. So you are taking a heavier burden because the Assessor can't get out and find all these new things. They are always out there in the field looking for more property that is assessable and getting them on the roll, and it helps everybody because when properties have been enlarged or improved if they don't get on the roll the people are not paying taxes. And the only way you can get them on the roll is to provide the Assessor with the resources to do the job. And the Assessment Roll and the Assessor's Office is the financial foundation for the town. It is very serious to defund and cut the resources for. You are slitting your throat. Councilwoman Seaman interrupted noting nobody defunded the Assessor's position. Supervisor Hyde continued noting and so if we're to take the money out of unassigned fund balance which we have plenty of. So my suggestion would be to bring her back for the rest of the year and into next year because it is a very

important position. And we are getting a big bang for our buck. Councilwoman **Ackley** asked if there was a conflict of interest with her holding two positions for the town. The **Town Clerk** noted no there is not. She clarified that **Brenda** was asking if there was a conflict because she is a clerk in the Assessor's office and a Deputy Town Clerk. Supervisor Hyde noted that when she was Town Clerk Sue Baker was one of the elected Assessors, and I had....Sue Baker was my Deputy Town Clerk, and before I appointed her I checked with the Association of Towns. I checked with the Comptroller's Office. I checked with everybody, and before I appointed her first Deputy Clerk I made sure there was no conflict of interest. There is no.....The Assessor's office doesn't take in any money in. **Councilwoman Seaman** stated they really are not supposed to hold two positions in town. **The** Town Clerk stated that is not true. Supervisor Hyde also noted that it was not true and that she could prove it was not a conflict of interest. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted yes, it is true, but the point of it is the Assessment Roll was completed and submitted to the county in June. Correct? Supervisor Hyde noted minus the properties that have improvements. They are not getting on the Assessment. Councilwoman Seaman noted I simply asked if it was submitted to the county in June. Correct. **Supervisor Hyde** noted that not everything is getting on the Assessment Roll because they are not capable of doing it because they are so underfunded and understaffed. Councilwoman Seaman continued Cynthia was the Assessment Roll submitted to the County in June. Correct? Supervisor **Hyde** noted it was submitted when it was supposed to be submitted. Councilwoman Seaman continued OK it was submitted in June. Alright so the Assessor had since June to the present until January 1st to do assessment of property. Councilwoman Harris asked do you know what his job is. Do you know what he does on a day to day basis. Councilwoman Seaman noted I know the STAR is done online now, and all of the STAR applications are completed online. He said that (inaudible) done. Councilwoman Harris asked why then is Sue meeting the elderly in different places like parking lots to help them out. **Supervisor Hyde** asked why are the Assessors in other towns paid twice as much. No more that twice as much. Why are the other paid 38, 39 \$40,000.00 and our Assessor gets paid \$11,000.00 to do the same job. That is a disgrace. **Councilwoman Seaman** stated that is what the pay was when he applied for it. Supervisor Hyde noted it was (inaudible) if he had a clerk. He was willing to split the \$22,000.00. He got \$11,000.00 and the clerk got \$11,000.00, but then when

the Board decided to delete the clerks position they didn't give him that 11,000. They said you are going to do.....You had two people doing the job. Before you had three people. Now you are going to do the whole job, and you are going to get half the pay. Your pay is not going to be increased, but you are going to do the whole job for \$11,000.00 when other Assessors.....Councilwoman Ackley asked did you have to go through Civil Service or anything to create that job? Supervisor **Hyde** noted she took the Civil Service test. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted you have to post it, then you have to apply for that position. It has been deleted. **Supervisor Hyde** noted she had to take the test which she did, and she passed. **Councilwoman Seaman** asked for what? What did she take the test for? **Supervisor Hyde** repeated she took the Civil Service test, and she passed. So there is no problem with that. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted that is great, but that job if it is a Civil Service position needs to be posted at the County first. She doesn't automatically get it. **Councilwoman Harris** noted that job has been here since day one. Even when you were on the Board the last time. Councilwoman Seaman stated no it has not. It was a created position. Supervisor Hyde noted you have created an unfair position in the town. So let's call the vote. Councilwoman **Ackley** asked **Councilwoman Harris** why don't you collect the Historian pay? **Councilwoman Harris** noted first of all you took it off the budget. **Councilwoman Ackley** noted I am saying before that. Why did you not collect it. **Councilwoman** Harris asked so what is your question actually. Councilwoman Ackley asked why you have not (inaudible) Historian pay. Supervisor Hyde stated because that is a conflict of interest because she is on the Board. So she decided to do it for free. **Councilwoman Harris** noted I can't do it because I am on the Board. Councilwoman Seaman noted ah, two positions. Councilwoman Ackley noted the Law Book is not, is not...It's very grey. Councilwoman Harris noted I can't hold two offices. Elected. I'm elected so I couldn't be paid. Supervisor Hyde noted if somebody else wants to do it they can get paid, but nobody else wants to do it. **Councilwoman Seaman** stated she would like to see that in writing. Besides the fact that it is a Civil Service position if (inaudible). **Supervisor Hyde** noted we are talking about the Assessor Clerk. Can we have a vote. Councilwoman Seaman noted you can't do something without identifying the source to fund it. Supervisor Hyde noted you are asking this man to do this entire job for very little pay. He needs his assistant. Councilwoman Seaman stated he is not doing anything right now. Councilwoman Harris stated oh come on. Councilwoman

Seaman noted he's had June until now to do whatever he needs to do. **Supervisor** Hyde noted Mrs. Seaman I have not seen any Board Members step foot in that office, and find out what is going on. So don't tell me that you know what he is doing. You have no idea of what the workload is in that office. And may I remind you that every year more and more things, in all of our offices, things that didn't have to be done before. Things keep evolving, and new things have to be done. It isn't working. Councilwoman Seaman noted then why did he agree to do it for \$11,000.00? Councilwoman Harris stated because he had an assistant for another \$11,000.00. He was willing to split the pay (inaudible). Councilwoman Seaman noted that **Cynthia** has said that it is not just about the other person. If we increased his salary and double it he would do the position. Supervisor Hyde noted he would prefer to have an the clerk because..... Councilwoman Seaman noted OK there is something wrong there. That is two separate issues. Either he can do the position or he doesn't do the position. Supervisor Hyde stated let's call the vote. Councilwoman Ackley asked if we could table that. Councilwoman **Seaman** noted she agreed with tabling the resolution. **Supervisor Hyde** noted OK we table the resolution. Councilwoman Ackley noted I would like to look into that more. Like I said the law book is very....It does't state.....Supervisor Hyde noted to **Councilwoman Ackley** are you worried about a conflict of interest? Councilwoman Ackley noted that, and if well other things also. Supervisor Hyde noted to Councilwoman Ackley that if you tell me what you are looking at or wanting to know so we can help you find the answers. **Councilwoman Seaman** was talking over them. Councilwoman Ackley noted she just wanted to contact the Association of Towns with stuff like that. In the book, the Law Book says you should....It doesn't say in there specifically, but it says you should pretty much ask a lawyer about conflict of interest of different positions. Councilwoman Seaman noted I think it is an excellent idea. Supervisor Hyde noted to Councilwoman Ackley well call Mark Schachner tomorrow and ask him. Councilwoman Seaman stated no he needs to come here so we can ask him. Councilwoman Harris noted she can do it on her own. Councilwoman Seaman stated no. Councilwoman Harris noted she can do it any way she wants. She is a grown up lady let her do it the way that she wants. **Supervisor Hyde** noted to **Councilwoman Ackley** after the meeting I'll give you his number. You are a Board Member, call Mark **Schachner** up and he will get answers for you. I will give you the number before you leave. OK so we will table that.

Resolution # 125

On a motion introduced by **Councilwoman Harris** and seconded by **Supervisor Hyde**

RESOLUTION TO PAY THE DEPUTY TOWN CLERK

The town Board of the Town of Thurman agrees to reinstate the paid Deputy Town Clerk position.

Discussion: Supervisor Hyde noted that we have a Deputy Town Clerk. This Deputy Town Clerk has been a Deputy Town Clerk through....She worked with **Susan** this year and last year. She worked with **Jeannie**, and she was my Deputy Town Clerk, and she was also the Town Clerk years ago in the early 70s. She has served the town well. She is a very excellent Town Clerk because of her great education and skill and knowledge of the town of Thurman. She has been with us for so long. She has come in here and helped **Susan** for free. It is not fair. We had a good budget that funded this position. I think the budget was \$4,000.00 wasn't it? We had the revenue to cover it as well as the Assessor Clerk position. We had the revenue to cover that. It was never a problem of not having the money. The money is there for these positions. So I recommend that we do what is appropriate, what is right, what is fair, and also do what the taxpayers in this town paid for in the first place when they paid their taxes they paid for what was in the Budget for them to have. We raised taxes for them to have these things, and they did not get it because it was defunded. So I would like to see this excellent Clerk get paid. She deserves it. The town's people deserve it. The Town Clerk deserves it, and it isn't right It isn't right what is being done. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted nobody says anybody doesn't deserve to be paid. The Deputy Supervisor was an unpaid position. It is absoluty in the rules that we can make the Deputy Town Clerk an unpaid position. It has been an unpaid position since I believe July 12th or 13th somewhere around there, and that funding line was eliminated because it had to go to pay the \$300,000.00 defaulted loan. You had to identify a source of funding. That was the funding. Supervisor Hyde noted well Mrs. Seaman we paid off the \$300,000.00 debt. The whole thing, and we still have, lets see, \$255,833.02 in the General Fund. Councilwoman Seaman interrupted noting minus what you owe the Highway Department. Minus what you owe the Highway Department. Supervisor Hyde noted that the pidilly amount that you saved by not paying the Assessor Clerk.....The total amount budgeted for the Assessor Clerk was \$11,000.00 and the Deputy Town Clerk was \$4,000.00. That is \$15,000.00. OK you didn't pay your \$300,000.00 loan off by deleting those positions or not paying them. We have plenty of money to pay our Deputy Town Clerk. Councilwoman Seaman noted OK Cynthia, you only got that extra \$140,000.00 in October and November. When we went and eliminated those positions you had maybe \$28,000.00 to operate the town with, and that was according to the bank statements. Supervisor Hyde noted Mrs. Seaman, Mrs. **Seaman** we have always had plenty of operating money to fund. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted it was all frozen, and you know it. **Supervisor Hyde** stated **Mrs. Seaman** you always fail to prove anything that you say. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted the bank proved it by freezing the funds. Supervisor Hyde noted Mrs. **Ackley** if you would like I would be more than happy to sit down with you, have every single bank statement from every single month, and prove to you that we had the money to pay the Deputy Town Clerk and the Assessor Clerk all along. Councilwoman Ackley asked why are you talking to me about this. You are arguing with Gail (inadible). Supervisor Hyde responded because you were one of the Board Members who agreed to it, and I am not going to.... I know that Mrs. **Seaman** is never going to agree with this because **Mrs. Seaman** has a very personal vendetta against the Assessor's Office, and I am appealing to you because I feel you are a reasonable person, and I would like to show you the proof, you would understand. **Councilwoman Seaman** spoke over the **Supervisor** noting we voted this down. That is your opinion. I do not. This has nothing to do with the person. It has to do with position and finances of the Town.

A Roll Call Vote Was Called.

Motion Carried: Ayes~3 Ackley, Harris, Hyde, Nays~1 Seaman

Councilwoman Ackley asked where the funds where coming from. Supervisor Hyde responded from Unappropriated Fund Balance. Councilwoman Seaman asked how much is in the Unappropriated Fund Balance is there Cynthia. I'd like to know. Councilwoman Harris told her to look at the report. Look at the paperwork. You don't know where to find it. Councilwoman Seaman stated it doesn't show. I have asked for the balance (inaudible). There is no money in the Unappropriated Fund Balance. You spent it all. Supervisor Hyde noted we will

Councilwoman Seaman asked from where Cynthia. Because you haven't designated what is in that fund. I'd like to know exactly what is in that fund. Supervisor Hyde noted we have plenty of money for the little tiny bit that the (Deputy) Town Clerk is going to make between now and December 31, 2019. Councilwoman Seaman noted you took \$50,000.00 out of it for the last BAN payment. Supervisor Hyde asked is everybody agreeing to move it from Unappropriated Fund Balance. Councilwoman Seaman asked how much is in the Unappropriated Fund Balance. Councilwoman Harris responded of course to the Supervisor, and look at your paperwork to Councilwoman Seaman.

Councilwoman Seaman responded it is not there. How much is in Unappropriated Fund Balance Cynthia? It is illegal to create a position without an appropriate source of funding. How much is in the Unappropriated Fund Balance that you won't tell us. That's the law in case you don't know it. Actually I believe a felony to write checks on an account with no money in it. Supervisor Hyde noted we just said that we were going to take the remaining amount out of Unappropriated Fund Balance Mrs. Seaman. Councilwoman Seaman stated it is against your oath of office in order to create and pay a position that doesn't have a source of money..... Councilwoman Harris and Councilwoman Seaman continued to discuss the funding. Supervisor Hyde asked to get a motion to get a resolution to accept the proposal by Mr. Englemann on the floor.

Resolution # 126

On a motion introduced by **Councilwoman Harris** and seconded by **Supervisor Hyde**

RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT PROPOSAL

The town board of the Town of Thurman accepts Mr. Fred Englemann's proposal to operate the Thurman Whitespace Network.

Discussion: Councilwoman Harris noted so he is doing the operation part of it. **Supervisor Hyde** responded right. **Councilwoman Harris** noted so it will bring in more people. It is going to keep us up and running better because he created it so he knows how to run it. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted we don't have any money to pay (inaudible). **Supervisor Hyde** stated we have bills to pay, and we need the revenue to come in. The **Supervisor** called for the vote. **Councilwoman Ackley**

noted hold on I want to table this for two reasons. One I want to know after he does this update that he is doing I want to know how many people are still working after the update was done. And number two I agree with whoever has stated that we should ask how many people want to get on Whitespace before we.....Councilwoman Seaman noted she thought that was an excellent idea. Supervisor Hyde noted we have bills. Noting we need an operator to get the money to pay the bills. I don't know who is going to do this survey, but hopefully.....Councilwoman Seaman noted the Town needs to do it Cynthia. **Supervisor Hyde** asked so are we going to take out ads in the paper? Councilwoman Seaman asked what do you suggest. Supervisor Hyde noted you can throw out do a survey, but you have to have a plan to do a survey. So then the Town Board will have to meet again, and discuss how to do the survey we are going to do. The **Town Clerk** asked where are you going to get the postage to send post cards. You don't have money for that. **Supervisor Hyde** asked what. The **Clerk** repeated what she had said. **Supervisor Hyde** noted that is right we have to pay for postage, we have to print the cards. Councilwoman Seaman noted yup, you got plenty of toner. Supervisor Hyde noted in the end we still have to operate the network. We still have to pay the bills. Councilwoman Ackley noted that is why I said table it. There was discussion from the floor about how to do a survey. Someone suggested putting a sign up at the 418 bridge. **Councilwoman Ackley** noted that would result in many extra phone calls from people who don't follow the politics in town. Councilwoman Seaman noted it need to be in the target area. Supervisor Hyde noted that I could have sworn that the Town Board all year long wanted this thing fixed. **Councilwoman Seaman** interrupted saying it is fixed. **Supervisor Hyde** continued and then (the Town Board) complained there were not enough subscribers. And now that we've got the opportunity....We got it fixed for free, and now we need someone to operate it and you want to wait and waste more time and not bring revenue in. Councilwoman Seaman noted it is not wasting time. Supervisor Hyde noted until we have an operator we don't know who is using it for free. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted **Cynthia** he knows exactly who is using it because he is in the computer system all the time. Supervisor Hyde noted people are using it for free, but we can't turn it off with out an operator. This is craziness. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted **Cynthia** we didn't have an operator last year and a half according to you. We need to know who is going to sign up. Supervisor Hyde noted I would

like....Let's vote on this. Councilwoman **Seaman** noted we wanted to tabled it. There are two who tabled it. **Supervisor Hyde** noted I do not want to table it. We need to move on this. It is almost December. All year long I have heard one complaint after the other about the Whitespace wasn't working. So we finally get it working, and now we need an operator, and you guys are going to waste more time. OK Let's just call a Roll Call, and if we don't have operator we don't have an operator. Councilwoman Seaman noted Cynthia the game changer is Fiber Optics is coming, and we need to know if it is going to be viable. Councilwoman Ackley noted we asked for it to be tabled. Supervisor Hyde noted she didn't want to table it. Do you want to table it she asked **Councilwoman Harris. Councilwoman** Harris noted no I think it needs to be taken care of immediately. Everybody has been complaining and screaming I want Whitespace, I want Whitespace, and you are not going to have it without an operator. **Supervisor Hyde** noted that the subscribers are not going to be happy if they don't.....Councilwoman Ackley noted well I want to know how many people are working after he does the update. Councilwoman Harris noted he said he had 6 on. Councilwoman Ackley noted I want to know if all 6 are still up and running before I vote to hire an operator. **Councilwoman Harris** noted he did say they were up and running. **Supervisor Hyde** noted you won't be able to tell if they are up and running unless you have an operator. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted no that is not true. No. Councilwoman Ackley noted yes he can obviously. Supervisor Hyde noted Brenda he is not going to operate it unless you hire him. Councilwoman Seaman noted no **Cynthia. Supervisor Hyde** noted we can't know who is using it, who is not using it unless we have an operator who is going to go in there and tell us.

A Roll Call Vote Was Called.

Motion Failed: Ayes~2 Harris, Hyde, Nays~2 Ackley, Seaman

Supervisor Hyde noted the next resolution had to do with the Budget. I just want you to know that I do not support the Preliminary Budget. The Budget has to be adopted by the 20th. I feel that we need to work a little more on the Budget. Because there are some changes that I feel need to be made. One of which is if we are.....We had a resolution tonight to reinstate the Assessor Clerk. Now in the 2019 Tentative Budget I put in \$11,000.00 for Assessor Clerk. The Town Board left...When they made their changes to the Budget they left the 11,000 in there,

but they made it clear that they had no intention of hiring Susan Baker so.....Councilwoman Ackley interrupted noting so what Gail says and what I said are two different things. Supervisor Hyde noted right, but you have shown us..... Councilwoman Ackley asked shown you what? Supervisor Hyde continued we need to find out if we are going to have an Assessor Clerk before we decide whether or not we are going to raise the funds for it. So you do your homework on whether or not we need an Assessor Clerk. Councilwoman Ackley noted I didn't say we didn't need one, whether it was a conflict of interest. There is a difference. Supervisor Hyde noted you have all year said we don't need one so we want to make sure we need to raise that money. **Councilwoman Seaman** talked over the **Supervisor** noting **Cynthia** if we raise the money and don't use it we can transfer it to another fund. If we need it. It is there. Supervisor Hyde continues plus the Preliminary Budget has increases....There is a bunch of elected officials and appointed officials none of whom who have gotten an increase since 2013. In the Tentative Budget it was put in for every elected and appointed official to get a small increase. In the Preliminary Budget there is discrimination where three elected officials get increases and the rest don't. I find that very unfair, and I think that needs to be reworked. I would suggest that we do some thinking, and we come back and work on just coming up with a better plan for our Budget on the 20th. Councilwoman Seaman interrupted asking didn't you vote yes on the Preliminary. Supervisor Hyde continued that we call a Special Meeting, and we sit down. Councilwoman Seaman noted no we have a Preliminary Budget right here. Supervisor Hyde stated I am not comfortable with your Preliminary Budget. Councilwoman Seaman stated but you voted yes for it. Supervisor Hyde noted we can't go with the Tentative Budget because we paid off the BAN. So that one isn't going to work anymore. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted if we do not pass a Budge the Preliminary Budget becomes the Budget for the Town. Supervisor Hyde noted no the Tentative does. Councilwoman Seaman noted no the Preliminary does. It is in the Law Book. The Law Book says Preliminary. Supervisor **Hyde** replied OK whatever. But anyway I do not approve of the Preliminary Budget. I would like to.....I think it needs more work, and I would like to do a little more work, and I do not support adopting the Budget tonight that is the Preliminary Budget. I don't believe.....It wasn't done with the taxpayer in mind. It wasn't done for appropriate reasons it was more of the same. Councilwoman **Seaman** noted we sat here, all of us, for two hours and we went line by line.

Councilwoman Ackley noted Joan you agreed to half of them. Councilwoman **Seaman** stated you agreed with them. You agreed to the Preliminary Budget. You passed it. Councilwoman Ackley noted you tell me what you think is unfair. That is what I want to know Cynthia. Supervisor Hyde responded well for one thing you don't give raises to some people and not other when people have no explanation. No explanation what so ever. Councilwoman Ackley noted we (inaudible) raises. Supervisor Hyde stated I put in raises for everybody including the Town Board. Councilwoman Ackley replied you did not do the Budget. Deb did the budget. **Supervisor Hyde** replied no. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted yes she did. Councilwoman Ackley continued yes she did, and I asked you to have her here so we could ask her questions. Supervisor Hyde replied Debra and I did the Budget. Councilwoman Ackley noted Deb did the Budget. Councilwoman Seaman noted Debra did the Budget, and we know that. Supervisor Hyde continued and I put in for increase for everyone including the Town Board. You can not discriminate. Councilwoman Seaman noted yes you can. It is not discriminating. Supervisor Hyde continued you can not discriminate. That is not right. Either give everybody the increase or nobody the increase. Not some and not the others. Not to mention the fact that you did not have a reason. **Councilwoman Seaman** interrupted noting you don't have to have a reason. **Supervisor Hyde** continued you also were after all year long, I thank you for finally refunding the Deputy Town Clerk, but after all year of refusing to pay the Deputy Town Clerk or the Assessor Clerk you turn around, and you are ready to keep on taxing people for these positions when you made it very clear all year long that you wouldn't have somebody in there so the money was raised for nothing because it was never used for the proper purpose so you must have some reason in your back pocket that you wanted to raise that money. You made it very clear that.....Councilwoman Seaman interrupted noting well some of it could because you put in \$14,400.00 in revenue for the Whitespace that was going to be coming in, but that isn't going to come in. Because if we are lucky we will get 4 so that is going to have to be moved to pay those bills that you didn't account for. You can't account for revenue that doesn't exist. **Supervisor Hyde** continued I would like us to work a little harder on the Budget. Councilwoman Ackley asked in five days are we going to have five Special Meetings just to (inaudible). Councilwoman Seaman noted just to get what she wants. She will call a meeting every day like she was told, and if we get sick of it we might give in to her. Supervisor Hyde responded

no, I don't feel that the Preliminary Budget is the proper Budget, and that is just my opinion. Councilwoman Harris noted I liked the Tentative Budget because (inaudible) the Preliminary. Councilwoman Seaman noted well you don't get that (inaudible) the Preliminary. Supervisor Hyde noted that is where we may need to work. We might need to look at the Tentative Budget, but take out the BAN because we already paid that. Councilwoman Harris noted that is right, and we still stay under the Tax rate. Supervisor Hyde noted what I would like to say about the Tentative Budget is, the Tentative Budget covered everything. Councilwoman **Seaman** stated you don't get to go back. **Supervisor Hyde** continued the Tentative Budget covered everything, and stayed under the tax cap. As long as the payment for the BAN was not in there it was under the Tax Cap. So the Tentative Budget without having to make the payment of the BAN, it is already paid off, is under the tax cap also, and it is a more fair Budget when it comes to the salaries. **Councilwoman Seaman** stated it doesn't have to be fair. It has to be fiscally responsible. Councilwoman Harris replied and it is. Supervisor Hyde responded that it is not fiscally responsible to raise taxes for a position that you have no intention of filling Mrs. Seaman, and you know darn well that if it was up to you.... You don't want to fill that Assessor position, but yet you want to tax the people for it. That isn't proper. Councilwoman Ackley asked what do you mean if there is a conflict of interest, this is my (inaudible). **Supervisor Hyde** responded there isn't **Brenda. Councilwoman Ackley** noted I am saying so if there is? What do you do? You have to ask somebody to take the Civil Service. Somebody gets the job. Supervisor Hyde responded yeah, and do you know who would get the job. Susan because she took the Civil Service test. Councilwoman Ackley noted I said if there was. Councilwoman Seaman stated she has to score the highest. Supervisor Hyde noted she took the test. Councilwoman Ackley noted you don't understand that from when I started talking so.... Supervisor Hyde noted she took the test, and I can guarantee you that it is not a conflict of interest. Councilwoman Harris noted she has been here for years. She has proven that she is available and capable of doing the job. The pay is not (inaudible) you are not over paying her. She puts in good time. The people in town know her. They work with her, and she works with them. (inaudible) wanting to hire someone she meets everyone of them, type A. Councilwoman Seaman stated we aren't hiring. Supervisor Hyde continued and it is highly suspicious of the Town Board to refuse to pay for that position this year even though it was Budgeted and, for the other position even though it was

budgeted they want to leave those Budget amounts with out good reason. Councilwoman Seaman noted I would like to read this please. Right out of the Law Book. On page 59. The Budget must be adopted by November 20th, and be reported in the minutes of the Town Board. It then becomes the Annual Budget for the Town for the next fiscal year. If the Town Board fails to adopt a budget by November 20th the Preliminary Budget with such changes that the Town Board may have made will constitute the Budget for the Fiscal Year. The Preliminary Budget that you voted yes on. After we made all sorts of changes over a two hour period. Supervisor Hyde noted well right now we are voting on whether or not we are going to pass this budget. The Preliminary Budget. Councilwoman Seaman noted this Budget is the Preliminary Budget. Now I would like to make a change to one of the lines because you did not account for the \$14,000.00. You added \$14,000.00.....We have to account for \$14,000.00 that you added in that we were getting from the Whitespace that we are not getting. There is only \$300.00 a month. Supervisor Hyde noted if you want to make changes come to the meeting on the 20th, and we will.....Councilwoman Seaman noted uh no, this is where we are making the changes. Supervisor Hyde noted the minute you make changes you have to change the summery page. Councilwoman Seaman replied no you don't. You can change the summery page. We can adopt the Budget with that change. Or we can just adopt the Preliminary Budget right now. **Supervisor Hyde** noted well let's call a vote. **Councilwoman Seaman** asked is that what you want to do? Supervisor Hyde noted let's get a motion on the floor to adopt the Preliminary Budget as the 2019 budget. Councilwoman Seaman noted we need to add the changes to that. Supervisor Hyde asked do I have a motion. **Councilwoman Ackley** noted so you are skipping a resolution. **Supervisor Hyde** responded the one before, the resolution to adopt the budget which would be adopting a Preliminary Budget. I think we need to work on it more. I think we owe the taxpayers more than that. Councilwoman Seaman noted we can work on it right now. Supervisor Hyde asked so introduced by? Motion?

Resolution # 127

On a motion introduced by **Councilwoman Harris** and seconded by **Councilwoman Seaman**

RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE 2019 BUDGET

The town board of the Town of Thurman adopts the 2019 budget.

Discussion: Councilwoman Seaman noted I will second it so we can talk about it. Supervisor Hyde noted if you are going to make changes I am afraid that we can't vote on it. Councilwoman Seaman noted yes you can. Supervisor Hyde noted because you have to change the summery page. Councilwoman Seaman noted no we can make changes to the Preliminary Budget, and then approve it. Yeah actually you can do that. It says it right there. Supervisor Hyde asked what changes do you want to make. Councilwoman Seaman noted the changes that I would really like to make because you did not account for the \$14,000.00 that is going to be going out. I would like do we have a contingency? Yup, contingency account A1990.4. Right now it stands at \$10,000.00. I would just like to make that \$20,000.00 so that we know that if we don't get added revenue we are going to have money that is available to pull from to pay those Frontier bills. **Supervisor Hyde** asked you want to add \$10,000.00 to the budget? **Councilwoman Seaman** noted I want to add \$10,000.00 to the......Supervisor Hyde interrupted asking does it stay under the tax cap? **Councilwoman Seaman** replied I assume it does. **Supervisor Hyde and Councilwoman Harris** noted you can't assume that. Councilwoman Seaman noted well we will make it this way. We will add \$10,000.00 to that line under the condition that we are under the tax cap. If we are not under the tax cap then we will not prove that line. Councilwoman Harris stated I can't do that. Councilwoman Seaman asked why? It takes care of your question, and we will then approve a Budget. Supervisor Hyde noted I don't approve the Preliminary Budget as the budget to adopt. I would like to see the Tentative Budget without the tax cap. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted you can't. You can't. Sorry. We have the Preliminary Budget that is the budget that we have. Supervisor Hyde noted so we are talking about.... Are we going to adopt the Budget tonight or not? Councilwoman Seaman noted if we don't then it just becomes the law of the land anyway. **Supervisor Hyde** noted either the Tentative or the Preliminary at this point. Councilwoman Seaman responded no, the Preliminary is the Budget you get to work with now. You don't get your chance....You already had your chance. **Supervisor Hyde** noted well these (inaudible) I would like to see a more fair budget. I would like to see the salaries either all increase or none of them increase. So I would like to see some changes then work on some changes, and then make sure that the....We could bring to a

meeting on the 20th. We can bring.....Councilwoman Seaman noted you know what. We have things to do on the 20th Cynthia. I have other things to do. I mean it is just before Thanksgiving. Supervisor Hyde noted I am not prepared to vote yes on the Preliminary Budget. Councilwoman Seaman interrupted noting yeah, it is two days before Thanksgiving. Supervisor Hyde continued and I think this...I am not comfortable with this. Councilwoman Seaman noted we worked for two hours, and you approved and agreed on everything single change we made into this Preliminary.... You voted to accept them....Supervisor Hyde noted I did not. I voted no. Councilwoman Harris also noted that she did not. Supervisor Hyde noted let's call for a vote whether or not we are going to approve a budget tonight. A Preliminary Budget tonight. Roll Call.

A Roll Call Vote Was Called

Motion Failed: Ayes~2 Ackley, Seaman, Nays~2 Harris, Hyde

Supervisor Hyde noted the motion failed. Councilwoman Seaman noted that's OK on the 20^{th} it becomes the Budget of the town. Supervisor Hyde noted the last one was payment of the claims. Councilwoman Seaman noted oh before we pay the claims I'd like a resolution on the floor because we had tabled it from last week. We need to talk about paying back the Highway the \$57,878.77. Supervisor **Hyde** noted **Mrs. Seaman** we are not paying back the Highway. We did not take money from the Highway. Mrs. Ackley you might want to take some time, and come up maybe and sit down with me because it is a little bit.... Councilwoman **Seaman** noted all you have to do is produce a resolution that says you'd give it to them or you could take the funds from the Highway, and I won't say a word. If you can produce a resolution that says you were authorized to take that money out and put it in the general fund I am OK with it. But if you don't, if you can not produce that resolution you need to put it back into the Highway department because they are going to need it. It is Highway money. You have not completed the AUD. You do not know how much they have in their savings. So we still can't (inaudible). We have been after you to get the AUD done for some months. **Supervisor Hyde** noted one of the reasons I put this together **Brenda** is you were wondering about it. You had mentioned it at the last meeting that something about the Highway....So I guess I will have to take the time to explain. In 2016 they made a budget for 2017. In that Budget, and in the packet

here page one shows you the cover of the Budget that was adopted November 15, 2016. When they adopted that Budget they included in that Budget on page 11 they included \$129,994.00 for Consolidated Highway ----- which is the CHIP money. And they showed as a revenue, and the code is.... Brenda do you want to follow along with this because it helps you to understand. Councilwoman Ackley noted that she had read through the whole thing when I first got here. **Supervisor Hyde** noted this revenue, the problem is is that in order to get CHIPs money you have to have paved. You have to have paved roads. Then you have to take the bills from the paving, and you have to make copies of those, and you have to submit those to the state. And then the State reimburses you for the money that you spent. Well the problem was in 2016 they did no paving. So there were no paving bills to give to the State in order to get reimbursed. So when they put \$129,000.00 in the Budget that was a revenue that was never going to happen. So right from the get go the Highway Department thinks it is getting this revenue according to this budget they were never going to get. And which they never got. Because if you take the next two pages, on page 4 and page 5 this shows all the revenues because we had changes software. The first page is all the revenues from January 1, 2017 through September 30, 2017, and you can see the State Aid DA3501 it's at zero. Earned in 2015 zero. Then when you look from October 1st through December 31st it also isn't here because we never got it. So right from the get go we are now short 200 and the amount of that revenue. When you decide how much taxes you are going to collect for the Highway you have to figure how much you are going to collect by the revenue you are getting in. You have to know what your revenue is. Or you should know, and what is left has to raised in taxes. Well they didn't. They had a revenue in there that was basically never going to happen, and it didn't happen. Councilwoman Seaman interrupted asking how much is in that fund balance? **Supervisor Hyde** continued so on page 5 you can see here where State Aid Consolidated Highway Revenue should not have been shown in the Budget in 2017 because no State Aid Revenue could come in during the 2017 year. Because no paving which I just explained. Therefore the Highway was short \$129,994.00. Then in 2017 they paved, and they spent \$224,750.00 on paving in 2017. In 2017 they were able to take those paving bills, send the receipts to the State so they are going to get CHIPs revenue this year, but they didn't get any in 2017 so it had to come out of the Highway fund balance. So at the end of the year the Highway had a \$720.85 fund balance. Because they had

spent it all. Because they didn't get the CHIPs money. Councilwoman Seaman asked what was in their (inaudible) Supervisor Hyde continued they had \$5,780.85 by the end of the year. We had a resolution in 2017 to open an Highway account. Remember that Joan. We moved the 5,000 into this new account. We kept the \$720.85 in the Consolidated Account, and we paid the first 6 payrolls out of the Consolidated Account. We moved the 5,000 into the new Highway account. If you look at the bank statement, which I have on page 7, look on the bank statement for January 31, 2018, and you see that the total deposit of \$5,000.00 which we put in. Like I said there was 5,780.85 left in the Highway fund. So we took the \$5,000.00 moved it into the new account in order to open the account, but we didn't use any of that the first month. You all have it. If you look at that bank statement you will see there are no transfers for payroll. OK. Councilwoman Seaman asked Cynthia what was in their savings. Supervisor Hyde continued so then the first money to come out of the actual new Highway account didn't happen until February 14th. Which is the first time which is the first time we took money out of the Highway account to pay the payroll. So what was used to pay all the payrolls in January, which if you go to the next page, page 9 it shows that all those amounts are actually General Fund money. Because the Highway didn't have any money left. The only money that they had left in the Consolidated account once we moved that 5,000 was \$750.00. So when we paid the payroll out of the Consolidated we paid it out of General fund money. It's in the Highway code, but it's not Highway money because their money, all but 750 was put into their new account. So it was General fund money. There was no Highway money taken and put into the General fund. It was the Highway.....Councilwoman Seaman interrupted noting the moneys were combined until you separated them. Supervisor Hyde said yes. Councilwoman **Seaman** noted they have more money than just their budget. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Gail** when you had the Consolidated account you still knew how much was in the Highway, and how much was General. It was hard to know, but you still knew. Councilwoman Seaman noted no you hadn't done the AUD. You didn't know what was in the savings. Supervisor Hyde noted you can't have a revenue in the Budget, and then not get it and expect that the Highway is going to have money leftover at the end of the year. Councilwoman Seaman noted but, Cynthia you overspent on the Budget. Supervisor Hyde noted well Gail I am trying to explain. So then....Councilwoman Seaman interrupted noting no, you had money.

Their budget might have been worn out, but they had.... Supervisor Hyde said it wasn't Highway money, it wasn't Highway money. Councilwoman Seaman noted well you have to prove that. Because you don't (inaudible), and you didn't come to the Board to tell us. Supervisor Hyde continued the last two pages will (inaudible) so in other words I am giving you proof here that this money that was used to pay the payroll the first...All the payrolls of the first month, and the first payroll of the second month in 2018 were General fund money. That is were it came from. Councilwoman Seaman noted no. Supervisor Hyde continued that is where it came from. Highway didn't have.....Councilwoman Ackley noted it didn't matter where it came from what matter is you did it illegally. **Councilwoman Seaman** stated that's right. **Supervisor Hyde** noted I didn't do it illegally. Councilwoman Seaman replied yes you did. Councilwoman Ackley noted there was no resolution. We knew nothing about it. It says in the law book it says once you put it into the Highway you can not take it out. Supervisor Hyde noted no money was moved. There was no money. The Highway bank account was a separate bank account. We didn't take any money out of that. We didn't take any money. Councilwoman Seaman continued once you put it in the Highway you can't take it out **Supervisor Hyde** continued there was \$7...We used the 750. All that was left in the Consolidated account once we took, you are not listening. Councilwoman Seaman replied you're not listening. Supervisor Hyde continued \$5,750.00 was all that was left in the Highway. That's all the money they had. Councilwoman Seaman stated that's what you say. Supervisor Hyde continued we took 5,000 of that, and we put it in the new Highway account. That only left 750 in the Consolidated account. **Councilwoman Ackley** asked who is we. You say we who is we. **Supervisor Hyde** replied the Town Board approved that we open an account.....Councilwoman Seaman interrupted stating no we didn't. **Supervisor Hyde** continued in 2017 at the end of the year. Yes they did I have a resolution to prove it. Councilwoman Ackley noted Ok but did they approve you to move all that money? Councilwoman Seaman stated no. Supervisor Hyde noted they approved opening a Highway account. We did it..... Councilwoman **Ackley** interrupted noting I didn't ask about the account. Is there a resolution says yes that you can take all this money. Supervisor Hyde noted it wasn't all this. It was only \$5,000.00. So we opened it with the 5,000 left the 750 in the Consolidated account. And so when we paid the payroll, the first 5 payrolls of the year for 2018, we used General fund money because we used \$750.00 of the

Highway money. But the rest of the money that covered that payroll was general fund money because the 5,000 was moved. The whole point of moving the money was so you would have a better sense of where it is. Councilwoman Seaman spoke over her noting you don't get to do that (inaudible). Supervisor Hyde continued as you can see when you have a Consolidated account it is very confusing. So we did not use Highway....Are you following me? Councilwoman **Seaman** noted you just took money out of the Highway Department to put in the General fund. Supervisor Hyde noted no we didn't. They only had \$750.00 left in the Consolidated account. Councilwoman Seaman noted Cynthia the bank statement says....Supervisor Hyde interrupted noting Gail you can say that all day long. Gail where is your proof that is what happened. Councilwoman Seaman replied right here in the bank statement. You moved it on July 31st. \$57,000.00. Here's the town Highway. You took \$57,878...**Supervisor Hyde** interrupted noting it wasn't their money Gail. Councilwoman Seaman replied it was their money it was in their account. That's the law, that's the law. Supervisor Hyde replied it wasn't their money Gail. Councilwoman Seaman replied that is the law. **Supervisor Hyde** noted the Highway only had \$5,750.00 at the end of the year, and a lot of this is because of your poor budgeting the year before. That is why I am very concerned with you and budgeting. Councilwoman Seaman noted you're the one who did the budget. This is their funds it must be returned. So I'm going. **Supervisor Hyde** noted alright **Gail** I have done everything under the sun to prove to you what I am telling you, and even black and white proof and you people don't want to believe it. Councilwoman Seaman noted do we get to vote on this? **Councilwoman Ackley** noted I understand completely what you are saying. The problem is you took the money from the Highway account without one a resolution, and two the book says it's illegal. Supervisor Hyde noted it wasn't Highway money. Councilwoman Ackley noted it doesn't matter you took it from that account. Read your book it's illegal. **Supervisor Hyde** noted it is not Highway money. Councilwoman Ackley noted I am not saying it is Highway money I'm just saying that you took it from that account. **Supervisor Hyde** noted do me a favor. Would you please come into the Town Hall so that we can sit down....Councilwoman Ackley interrupted noted oh my good lord. Councilwoman Seaman noted here we go. Supervisor Hyde continued why do you say it like that. We have asked you over and over to come in so we can explain to you. Councilwoman Ackley noted why do you think I am an idiot. I am

far from being an idiot. So....Supervisor Hyde interrupted noting I don't think I act like you are an idiot, but I would really appreciate it if.....Councilwoman Ackley interrupted noting all year long all you have done is bash the Board. Brenda and **Doug** come in here, come in here you don't know what you are doing. Councilwoman Seaman noted every single board meeting you start with a dissertation of demeaning three Board Members including myself, and you read it and include it into the minutes. You are the one who does it every single meeting. Councilwoman Harris noted almost every meeting you run your mouth (inaudible). Supervisor Hyde noted I think it is the other way around. It is a little bit hard to... Councilwoman Seaman noted it is right here Cynthia you took it out of the Highway. It's right there. Supervisor Hyde noted we had a year of not paying bills, we had a year of not paying people, (inaudible), and you want me to be happy (inaudible as Councilwoman Ackley and Seaman spoke over her) yes I am happy you are doing that, but why.... Councilwoman Seaman noted so let's put the money back to the Highway where it belongs because you couldn't even take it out. Supervisor Hyde noted we might as well just face it if at a meeting Mrs. Seaman is going to sit here....The only reason that I brought this up is because last meeting, this big long thing where no proof is given. So I feel it is important to actually prove what you say, and I feel that I do that. I also put these on the Town website. I am sharing this information with everybody. I am not hiding anything. I am not doing anything wrong. And get used to the fact that if you are going to sit here, and say things that are not true I am going to come back and disprove you. With proof. Councilwoman Seaman stated Cynthia, Cynthia just show me the resolution that says you can do this on July 31st. Just show me the resolution and I will let it go. Otherwise it has to go back to the Highway, and I would like to vote on the resolution to return the money to the Highway from once it was taken. And I am going to make that motion. Supervisor Hyde noted Mrs. Seaman I don't see any resolution prepared by you. Councilwoman Seaman noted I don't have to. You made a whole bunch that weren't prepared so a motion is made to return to the Highway department \$57,787.77 from the Consolidated from ,from the Consolidated fund to return it to the Highway fund where it was taken on July 31, 2018 and deposited into the Consolidated. So it needs to go back. Do I have a second? **Supervisor Hyde** noted (inaudible) she just had a big fit about paying the Deputy Town Clerk. Councilwoman Seaman noted I want the money to go back to the Highway. It's Highway money. Supervisor Hyde

noted see if you can get a second. Councilwoman Harris noted I hate to say this, but whose butt are you trying to bail out. When we did the....Councilwoman **Seaman** interrupted noting it's Highway funds. **Councilwoman Harris** noted don't interrupt me. The last time when we were doing the Budget you wanted to fan everything into the Highway Department oh they are going to buy a brand new truck. **Councilwoman Seaman** interrupted noting I didn't say that. Councilwoman Harris continued well that's what Doug said. They need a brand new truck. He told me they need a brand new truck. So you put a lot of money in there so they could have more material or more equipment. Councilwoman **Seaman** noted what do you mean me I couldn't do anything by myself the Board voted on it. Councilwoman Harris noted you were the one whose talking about it you were the one bringing it up, and this is what went on. So consequently when did you talk to **Pat.** When did you insinuate he didn't know what he was doing with his budget when he put it out, and when did he tell you that he was going to spend a lot of money on a new equipment. This is all something you brought up (inaudible). Councilwoman Seaman noted first of all we the Board all voted on it and voted yes. Councilwoman Harris noted I want to know where (inaudible as Councilwoman Seaman interrupted). Councilwoman Seaman noted unanimously. We voted on the Preliminary Budget. Supervisor Hyde stated we did not vote unanimously. I voted no. Councilwoman Seaman stated two hours. Yes it was. **Supervisor Hyde** noted I would never vote for a Budget that discriminates people. Councilwoman Seaman stated I believe you did. I will have to go back and look at the video. (inaudible). Supervisor Hyde said I did not vote yes on that Budget. Councilwoman Seaman noted I think you did. Supervisor Hyde said I did not Mrs. Seaman. Councilwoman Seaman noted but the point of this is this is Highway money you have to give it back to the Highway. Councilwoman Harris noted it is not Highway money. Councilwoman Seaman noted you didn't have a resolution. **Councilwoman Harris** noted the resolution is what your problem with it's not....Councilwoman Seaman interrupted noting I am just saying you can't move money from the Highway Department. Once it is in there it is illegal. **Supervisor Hyde** asked can we get on with paying the claims. **Councilwoman Seaman** asked are you going to move the money back. The **Town** Clerk noted actually Joan and Cynthia did not vote for the Budget they voted against it. Supervisor Hyde noted there Mrs. Seaman you really need to get your facts straight. Councilwoman Seaman noted well the Preliminary Budget passed.

Supervisor Hyde noted it is really tiresome to sit here....Councilwoman Seaman stated oh you didn't even know Supervisor Hyde continued and listen to you. The Town Clerk noted she said she didn't. Supervisor Hyde continued you know (inaudible) a lot of work, and every time you bring up these nonfactual things we feel we have to disprove you. Councilwoman Seaman talked over the Supervisor noting it is factual. Supervisor Hyde continued the people are...They deserve the truth not a bunch of lies. Councilwoman Seaman noted you took it out without a Board resolution. Supervisor Hyde continued part of why I do this is it is my hope that the new Board members will go over what I have provided them so they will understand. Because it is a lot to digest in one year. It takes a while.

Councilwoman Seaman spoke over the **Supervisor** noting here's where we demean the rest of the Board Members that they don't understand. She continued oh absolutely that is why you need **Deb** to do your budget.

Councilwoman Harris asked now who is condescending? **Councilwoman Seaman** said I wasn't that is a fact. **Deb** did it. **Councilwoman Harris** noted you don't know what goes on upstairs because you don't come in the front door. **Supervisor Hyde** noted nobody does. For all the decisions they make about what goes here they never bother to come in. That is the part that I can't figure out. **Councilwoman Seaman** spoke over the **Supervisor** as she spoke. **Supervisor Hyde** then noted a resolution to pay claims. Can I get a motion to put that on the floor.

Councilwoman Harris asked what are the totals? **Councilwoman Seaman** asked so we are not going to give the Highway back the money so I will have to send that to the **Comptroller**. **Councilwoman Harris** noted send it to the **Comptroller**, and have him do something about it. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted well the **Comptroller** makes phone calls (inaudible).

Resolution # 128

On a motion introduced by **Councilwoman Harris** and seconded by **Supervisor Hyde**

RESOLUTION TO PAY CLAIMS

General Fund \$5,152.91

Highway Fund \$6,257.92

Enterprise Fund \$50.00

PrePaid \$77,918.46

Supervisor Hyde noted the General Fund was \$5,152.91 which I might add here it is November and the total of General Fund bills that we have to pay this month is \$5,152.91 and there is still \$255,833.00 in the bank. Hmmm. Councilwoman **Seaman** noted minus the 58 that you have to give to the Highway. **Supervisor Hyde** noted say you did, say you did. There is still plenty of money. So there was never any reason not to pay the **Assessor Clerk** or the **Deputy Town Clerk** all year long. She noted the total for the Prepaid was \$77,918.46, but that is because it includes the \$59,964.55 which was already approved. So we don't need to approve that because it was already approved. Keep in mind that the reason the prepaid is so high because there is a payment for the BAN for \$59,964.55. That was already approved they don't need to approve that. The prepaid Highway was \$1,400.85, the prepaid General Fund was \$1,206.92, and the Enterprise prepaid was \$1,093.26. Councilwoman Seaman asked how much is the total \$77,918.....**Supervisor Hyde** interrupted noting no. Because we already got approval to pay that. **Councilwoman Seaman** noted it doesn't matter we still just (inaudible). **Supervisor Hyde** continued it's not coming off the total. The total is \$1,206.92 for the General Fund and the Enterprise is \$1,093.26. **Councilwoman** Seaman noted you said \$77,918.00 and Supervisor Hyde interrupted noting Gail we already approved paying the BAN. We are going to approve paying \$59,000.00 twice so you can run around and tell everybody we paid it twice. Councilwoman Seaman noted I never said I would (the rest was inaudible as they both spoke over each other. **Supervisor Hyde** noted we already approved that. **Brenda, me and Joan**, do you recall approving paying the 59,000 at the last meeting. So why would we approve it again? We won't. Councilwoman Seaman interrupted noting well nobody has a choice because you said so. **Supervisor Hyde** continued we are not approving. Then you are saying that we are paying it twice. We are not paying it twice. Councilwoman Seaman noted you pay the bills. Have fun. (inaudible). Supervisor Hyde stated we are not going to approve \$59,000.00 twice **Gail.** Forget it. So let's vote on what we have.

Motion Carried: Ayes~3 Ackley, Harris, Hyde, Nays~0 Abstain~1 Seaman

Councilwoman Seaman noted she abstained because she doesn't know how to do accounting so. I am not going to put my name on it. Because we don't have

Deb here to explain it. **Supervisor Hyde** noted **Gail** abstain is the same as no. Abstain is when you vote on something**Councilwoman Seaman** noted I can abstain. **Supervisor Hyde** noted well you can, you can. I just want to let the people know that usually you have (inaudible).

Adjournment: On a motion introduced by **Councilwoman Seaman** and seconded by **Supervisor Hyde** the meeting was adjourned at 9:46 pm with all voting aye to adjourn.

Respectfully Submitted

Susan E Staples, Town Clerk
December 31, 2019
Attachments